

Recommendation 68.3

GM

Gabriel Martinez [REDACTED]
Fri 8/13/2021 8:31 AM

To:

- Tanya Koshy [REDACTED]
- McGuire, Catherine (POL);
- Scott, William (POL)

+8 others

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer,

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 68.3 that were submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. This package focused on SFPD making its information more accessible to the public by translating and posting information on the SFPD website and open data portals. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 68.3: The SFPD should increase transparency by collecting and providing data, policies, and procedures to the public in multiple languages relevant to the local community through official SFPD website and municipal open data portals.

Response to 68.3: On December 10, 2020, SFPD published Department Bulletin 20-180, "Data Transparency Program." The Bulletin establishes SFPD's Open Data Program in policy, which includes SFPD publishing and releasing its data and assigns internal roles and responsibilities to ensure data is published on SFPD's website and on DataSF (<https://datasf.org/>). DataSF is an open portal where the public can download raw data related to policing and crime. SFPD's website also publishes crime and policing data, such as Crime Data Reports (<https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/stay-safe/crime-data/crime-reports>) and an impressive Crime Dashboard (<https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/stay-safe/crime-data/crime-dashboard>) where users can select districts for comparison by date and for different types of crimes. The Dashboard generates data visualizations based on the user's selections in real time. Most content on the SFPD website translates to over 90 languages.

On May 31, 2018, SFPD issued Department Bulletin 18-105, "Stop Data Collection System (SDCS) Implementation." The Bulletin requires collection of data for stops, searches, and arrests. SFPD's Stop Data Collection System complies with Racial and Identity Profiling Act (Assembly Bill AB 953) data collection requirements, which include the perceived LGBT status of the person stopped, whether the person stopped is limited English proficient, whether the person stopped is disabled, and whether the stop was made in response to a call for service, among other information. The SFPD Business Analyst Team (BAT) analyzes the stop data and provides thorough quarterly reports known as "96A" reports that are posted on the SFPD website.

Media Relations Unit Order 16-02, "Posting of OIS Data to Department Webpage," commits SFPD to updating the Published Reports webpage with current reports. Additionally, the associated "Unit Order 16-01 Social Media and Web Posting Checklist" directs SFPD to publish a variety of quarterly reports, including Internal Affairs Division sustained complaints, Firearm Discharge Review Board reports, and use-of-force reports. In January 2021, SFPD added DataSF to the checklist. Unit Order 16-01 directs SFPD's Social Media Manager to forward the reports to district station captains for use in their newsletters and community meetings.

Based upon all of the above, the Department of Justice finds that SFPD is in substantial compliance with this recommendation. Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss further. Thank you.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding # 68: The SFPD has poor data collection and analysis, which significantly impacts effective overall organization management and accountability. The technology in the SFPD requires significant updating. However, poor data collection practices, including lack of supervisory review and accountability for improperly completed reports and forms, etc., contributes to the poor data environment.

Recommendation # 68.3 The SFPD should increase transparency by collecting and providing data, policies, and procedures to the public in multiple languages relevant to the local community through official SFPD website and municipal open data portals.

Response Date: 12/15/2020

Executive Summary:

The San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) has implemented a formal policy and procedures to support its open data program efforts. The policy establishes formal data collection procedures and protocols to ensure information is made publicly available to increase transparency and accountability. Additionally, SFPD has developed a strategy to disseminate the publicly available information and identify methods for public consumption. As required by City Ordinance, SFPD makes this information available in multiple languages to the public on the SFPD website. The specific responses to each of the compliance measures below highlight the actions SFPD has taken to comply with this recommendation.

Compliance Measures:

1) Establish a formal policy to transparency in data.

The SFPD began its open data program efforts in 2010 in compliance with the City and County of San Francisco's (City) SF Open Data Policy—City Administrative Code Ordinance 293-10, codified in San Francisco's Administrative Code Section 22D. This policy was one of the most progressive in the country when it was signed into law in 2010 and is the foundation to which SFPD aligns its open data program. (See **Attachment 1: SF Open Data Policy**)

Department Bulletin 20-180: "Data Transparency Program" formally establishes the SFPD Open Data Program to provide its members guidance for the publishing and releasing of departmental data and the department's adherence to the SF Open Data Policy. (See **Attachment 2: DB 20-180 "Data Transparency Program"**)

2) Support the policy through procedures and protocols.

SFPD's Open Data Program establishes an administrative framework to make departmental data publicly available to increase transparency and accountability. The SFPD Department Data Coordinator manages all data requests and is the liaison to the citywide Chief Data



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Officer team and DataSF (the City's open data portal). The data coordinator position is within the Professional Standards and Principled Policing (PSPP) Unit and coordinates with internal data stewards and custodians for the ongoing evaluation and publication of data on the department's website and DataSF. (See [Attachment 2](#))

On Monday, December 21, 2020, SFPD Professional Standards members participated in a conference call with members of Hillard Heintze and the California Department of Justice. During the prescreening, suggestions and guidelines were discussed for his recommendation as described below:

Cal DOJ asked that SFPD provide greater detail about the processes in Department Bulletin 20-180, such as how often data sets are reviewed and coordination occurs between data coordinators and custodians. SFPD suggested that it could more fully explain the processes in a memo within the unit, and Cal DOJ was amenable to that.

The SFPD Data Coordinator maintains and updates the data inventory, reviews data sets for accuracy, security and privacy, and makes the department data available for publication to DataSF. The SFPD has implemented these procedures and protocols to make the department's data available on local, state and federal systems that aim to make policing more transparent and accountable to the public. At the request of Cal DOJ and Hillard Heintze, the Data Coordinator's Duties and Responsibilities were further clarified in an internal memorandum from the PSUPPU program manager on 12/22/2020. The Data Coordinator will not only make the data available to the public, but conduct privacy and security analysis prior to the release of new datasets, maintain a dataset inventory, and coordinate communications between data custodians, coordinators, and command staff. (See [Attachment 3: PSPPU Data Coordinator Duties & Responsibilities Memo](#))

Local systems

1. DataSF – SFPD has a live crime data feed that is shared publicly with our citywide open data portal, called DataSF. The public can access and download detailed raw data related to crimes. The general public can utilize this data in their products or for their own safety concerns (See [Attachment 4: SFPD Website Data Screenshots, Section 1](#)).
2. SFPD Crime Data Portal - In 2019, SFPD rolled out a crime data portal so the public can go to the new website to view crime related data the department publishes. Initially, SFPD began publishing crime data (See [Attachment 4, Section 1, No. 2a](#)). As the department's open data program has matured, citation, arrest and mapping data have been made available to the public (See [Attachment 4, Section 2, No. 2b](#)).

State Systems

3. SDCS System – SFPD implemented the use of the California Department of Justice's (DOJ) Stop Data Collection System (SDCS) to track the race, ethnicity, and other demographics of every person stopped by an SFPD officer (See [Attachment 4, Section II](#)). SFPD officers are required to enter and report all stop information into the DOJ's system. The department has an internal process to review and clean the data reported to the state, culminating in a quarterly report that is made available on the SFPD website.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Federal Systems

4. N-DEx System – In 2017, SFPD began sharing our data with the National Data Exchange (N-DEx) program, which is a national information sharing system that enables law enforcement agencies to search, link and share local, state, tribal and federal records (See Attachment 4, Section III). SFPD shares Crime Data Warehouse (CDW) data to the N-DEx system via an automated process to share data.

3) Develop a communication strategy that allows the public informed easy access, including website and municipal open data portals.

The SFPD has formalized a Communication Strategy to amplify the redesign of the main department website and 10 new District Station sites. The website refresh makes it easier for the department to post content and share data, policies, and procedures with our community in ways the department has not been able to before, including making the site content available in over 90 languages. (See Attachment 4, Section 1, No. 2a and 4 and Attachment 5: Communications Strategy Memo)

In this new format, the Media Relations Unit posts quarterly reports on the SFPD website (See Attachment 6: SFPD Website Published Reports):

- Use of Force/Officer Encounters (Legal Division Risk Management)
- Early Intervention System (EIS – Risk Management)
- Veronese (Police Commission)
- Firearm Discharge Review Board FDRB (Internal Affairs Division Administration)
- Sworn Member Demographics (Staff Services)
- Updates to OIS Open Investigations (PIO from Internal Affairs Division/Homicide/District Attorney)
- IAD Sustained Complaints (Internal Affairs Division Administration)

On Monday, December 21, 2020, SFPD Professional Standards members participated in a conference call with members of Hillard Heintze and the California Department of Justice. During the prescreening, suggestions and guidelines were discussed for his recommendation as described below:

Hillard Heintze expressed concern that SFPD had done a great job in gathering data and creating reports, but that the information was difficult for a member of the public to find. While the information is on the website, it is not readily apparent where to find things like SFPD's reports. SFPD will work on strengthening its communication strategy, and suggested a one-page document about navigating to data may be useful. Hillard Heintze thought that SFPD was on the right track.

The Communication Strategy identifies clear objectives and establishes the framework for the department's continued efforts to increase accountability and transparency. (See Attachment 5) The Media Relations Unit posts quarterly in its social media outreach campaign on platforms such as Twitter, Facebook, and Nextdoor, thereby conducting active community outreach. This outreach informs the public of department updates and the availability of department data, which increases transparency. To ensure that the public



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

is easily able to find the reports they are looking for on the website, the IT department created a "Published Reports User Guide" which will be included in future quarterly social media outreach campaigns (See Attachment 7: SFPD Social Media Posts and Attachment 8: SFPD Website Published Reports User Guide).

In January 2021, the Media Relations Unit updated the Quarterly Social Media and Web Posting checklist to include posting links to DataSF to inform the public of the available open data resources as well as the Published Reports User Guide. The links will be posted quarterly and include a summary of the publicly available data to highlight SFPD's transparency and accountability efforts, as well as the user guide which will ensure the public has practical knowledge of how to access SFPD's published reports. (See Attachment 9: Quarterly Social Media and Web Postings Checklist)

4) Ensure the communication strategy incorporates a variety of languages in use in San Francisco

In 2019, Hillard Heinz determined SFPD completed this compliance measure as part of the department's initial response as explained in 8/22/2019 RFI to SFPD.

The SFPD website can be accessed in over 90 languages for ease of use by all community members. The attached screen shots show how the public can find the use of force policy of SFPD in French (See Attachment 10: SFPD Website Access in French).