



Recommendation 4.7



Thu 1/7/2021 3:32 PM

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Altorfer, Eric (POL)

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer,

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 4.7 that were submitted as part of the collaborative reform process. After reviewing the package and information provided by SFPD, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 4.7:

The SFPD should assign the Training and Education Division to synthesize the issues emerging from the use of force reports and create announcements for roll call on emerging trends. The announcements can include scenarios from incidents that were troubling or complicated in some way and encourage officers to discuss with one another in advance how they would communicate and approach such situations.

Response to Recommendation 4.7:

In May 2019, SFPD established the Field Tactics/Force Options (FTFO) unit within the Training Division. The FTFO unit focuses on providing training oversight on field tactics and use of force. The FTFO unit developed a comprehensive, detailed training manual which details its wide range of responsibilities. Notably, the FTFO unit goes beyond the directive of compliance measure one, which recommends that SFPD report and analyze issues that it identifies from quarterly use of force reports. Instead of reviewing just quarterly reports, the FTFO unit reviews use of force data on a real time basis. The FTFO unit does so by reviewing a data dashboard developed by the Department's Business Intelligence Unit, which permits the FTFO unit to pull and review data derived from multiple sources, including HRMS and the Use of Force Supervisory Evaluation Forms. Though the FTFO unit can review this data at any time, it consistently reviews this data on a monthly basis as part of a meeting conducted by a multidisciplinary review committee, consisting of members from various units or teams (including Critical Incident Team and Physical Training/Defensive Tactics Unit). SFPD provided minutes from one of these monthly multidisciplinary review committee meetings in 2019. The minutes reflect that the review committee reviewed use of force data from the first quarter of that year, which reflected a decline in use of force and that pointing of a firearm accounted for nearly half (41 percent) of the use of force used by SFPD members.

The FTFO unit identifies emerging trends and training needs by also reviewing individual use of force incidents. SFPD requires any use of force incident that undergoes any formal Department administrative or criminal review—such as a firearm discharge—to undergo an additional review by the FTFO unit to evaluate the need for any training related to field tactics or force options. Command staff or other members may also refer any other incident to the FTFO unit for a more informal review. The FTFO unit developed a standardized summary report template to guide their review. Using the template, a member of the FTFO unit reviews and analyzes an incident by evaluating a variety of factors, including pre-deployment events and actions taken by the officer and the subject prior to the deployment of force. The FTFO member then analyzes the officer's actions and makes recommendations for any training or alternative actions.



[REDACTED]

SFPD provided examples of a FTFO summary report. One such report concerned an officer-involved shooting of an armed subject. In the FTFO summary report, the FTFO reviewer advised that while officers did a good job of advising dispatch of their location and the type of call to which they were responding, the FTFO reviewer noted that it "would have been more advantageous" if the officers had given dispatch this information in advance of making contact with the subject because then the officers would have "more time and cognitive space to respond to any type of threat or ambush. It also lowers an officer's stress level as it eliminates an extra task for an officer to have to complete." In response to this tactical deficiency, the FTFO reviewer recommended that the FTFO unit should issue a "Tactical Refresher" "reminding officers the importance of putting out information to dispatch prior to making contact a suspect, vehicle, etc."

The FTFO reviewer further observed that several officer-involved shootings in 2017 and 2018 (including the instant one) involved a subject ambushing an officer. In light of this trend, the FTFO reviewer recommended that the Department continue training on ambushes, among other issues, as well as scenario training where an officer is in a disadvantageous position. The FTFO reviewer also recommended one of the involved officers to meet with the FTFO unit for a debriefing related to deficiencies in his communications with his partner officer.

This example reflects the level of detail the FTFO unit puts into incident reviews and how these reviews are used to identify trends in use of force and recommendations for training. These incidents also go through additional layers of review: After a FTFO member completes their individual review, the review summary report is reviewed by the entire FTFO unit and then again by the multidisciplinary review committee described above. The multidisciplinary review committee also reviews underlying materials (including any body-worn camera footage and the incident reports). The review is then forwarded to the Commanding Officer of the Training Division and then onto any relevant Department review board that is reviewing the underlying incident for administrative or criminal violations (such as the Firearm Discharge Review Board).

On top of these data dashboard and incident reviews, the FTFO unit also conducts various trainings and debriefs to ensure ongoing education of members. For example, the FTFO unit conducts a Critical Mindset, Coordinated Response course that uses scenario-based training to refine skills related to critical decision-making, coordination, and tactics designed to reduce the need to use force. The FTFO unit also provided examples of other courses, including a course on AB 392, which changed California's use of force standard, and a video training on active shooter scenarios.

The FTFO unit also meets with external agencies, including the Department of Police Accountability, to identify any need for training or changes to relevant policies.

Based on the all of the above, the California Department of Justice finds SFPD in substantial compliance with this recommendation.

Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss this further. Thank you.

Tanya

Tanya S. Koshy
Deputy Attorney General
Civil Rights Enforcement Section
California Department of Justice
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2100
Oakland, CA 94612

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Finding # 4	The Use of Force Log captures insufficient information about use of force incidents.
Recommendation # 4.7	The SFPD should assign the Training and Education Division to synthesize the issues emerging from the use of force reports and create announcements for roll call on emerging trends. The announcements can include scenarios from incidents that were troubling or complicated in some way and encourage officers to discuss with one another in advance how they would communicate and approach such situations.

Recommendation Status	Complete	Partially Complete	In Progress
	Not Started	No Assessment	

Summary

The Training Division created the Field Tactics/Force Options unit and tasked unit members to review use of force and officer involved shooting incidents to identify training or procedural deficiencies, which if corrected, could result in use of less force to resolve incidents.

The unit established the “Critical Mindset and Coordinated Response” (CMCR) training curriculum. In this course officers learn an inter-disciplinary approach to resolving force incidents using de-escalation and crisis intervention principles. Scenario-based training is presented used during CMCR training and is reinforced periodically during roll-call. Topics discussed include contemporary and emerging force principles that will assist officers in resolving encounters with minimal use of force.

The department's response to this recommendation is designated as Complete; however, the team will continue to monitor the department to ensure the described policy and supportive practices are institutionalized.

Compliance Measures	Status/Measure Met
1 SFPD Training and Education Division report and analysis (synthesis) of the issues emerging from the quarterly use of force reports.	✓ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
2 Evidence of roll-call/line-up announcements on emerging use of force trends resulting from analysis.	✓ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
3 Evidence that the announcements are educational and scenario-based in a way that encourages officers to engage in discussion regarding the use of force.	✓ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
4 Continual review/improvement loop to advance knowledge and information.	✓ Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A

Administrative Issues

Compliance Issues



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding # 4

The Use of Force Log captures insufficient information about use of force incidents.

The SFPD does not have a separate use of force report for personnel to complete after a use of force incident. Rather the specific articulable facts leading to the force incident are documented in the narrative of a regular incident report form and a paper use of force log, making it difficult to collect accurate and complete data or analyze aggregate use of force data. In addition, it requires the staff to manually log the information into the Early Intervention System.

Recommendation # 4.7

The SFPD should assign the Training and Education Division to synthesize the issues emerging from the use of force reports and create announcements for roll call on emerging trends. The announcements can include scenarios from incidents that were troubling or complicated in some way and encourage officers to discuss with one another in advance how they would communicate and approach such situations.

Response Date: August 31, 2020

Executive Summary:

In order to synthesize emerging use of force issues to ensure timely and effective response to identified, emerging trends, the San Francisco Police Department formally launched the Field Tactics Force Options (FTFO) Unit in May 2019, attached to the Training Division.

[Attachment 1: "DB 19-100, New Training Division Unit: Field Tactics / Force Options."]

The FTFO Unit is responsible for providing training oversight, consistency and guidance with respect to the application of field tactics and force options by sworn members during encounters with suspects." [See video on FTFO Unit.](#)

The unit is also tasked with reviewing use of force and critical incidents on both specific and generalized scales to ensure that training properly addresses the needs of the members and agency. Data is derived from information including quarterly Use of Force, Firearm Discharge Review Board, and Early Intervention System reports, as well as their underlying statistics, to identify and respond to trends that officers are experiencing in the field and to ensure that use of force and tactical training prepares officers to safely, properly, and effectively address circumstances that may confront them. **[Attachment 2: "FTFO Procedural Manual."]**

In order to conduct data-driven analysis, the Department's Business Intelligence Unit developed a data dashboard with which the FTFO Unit can pull and review fundamental, real-time data derived from HRMS, CAD, incident reports, and UOF Supervisory Forms.

[Attachment 3: "FTFO Data Analysis" PowerPoint slides]. Information and analysis



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

developed from this data is considered on a monthly basis—in cooperation with the various training disciplines of the Training Division as well as the Department of Police Accountability—in order to identify patterns and trends related to use of force; consider the effectiveness and consistency of members' training; and identify and address shortcomings therein. Participating training disciplines include: Physical Training-Defensive Tactics (PTDT); Emergency Vehicle Operation Course (EVOC); Range; Recruit Training Office (RTO); Field Training Office (FTO); Continuing Professional Training (CPT), and the Crisis Intervention Team (CIT). **[Attachment 4: Sample FTFO Interdisciplinary Meeting Minutes]**

In addition, the FTFO Unit is tasked with reviewing specific complex, high-risk incidents to identify individual and organizational lessons that may be gleaned from them, with some types of critical incidents (e.g., Officer Involved Shootings) automatically assigned for such review. The training disciplines review and contribute to consensus Training Division-based analysis and recommendations that are derived from formal reviews. **[Attachment 5A: "Sample FTFO Interdisciplinary Review Meeting" and 5B: "FTFO Incident Review 19-008"]** These reviews, combined with occasional post-incident debriefings with patrol personnel, provide further insight into issues confronting members and their processing of tactical considerations and may result in identification of training issues that are addressed in a variety of ways. For example, Department Notice 19-224, "Communication Priorities" addresses issues raised by the FTFO review in the attached sample. **[Attachment 6: DN 19-224, "Communication Priorities"]**

The unit utilizes a variety of techniques to deliver the training, lessons and information to members. FTFO training utilizes scenarios, video discussion, tabletop exercises, debriefings and open ended questions to engage officers and develop their understanding of use of force issues and tactical considerations. Discussion and debate is strongly encouraged. Lively discussions have not only helped members better understand issues related to use of force, but have also provided the instructors with feedback about their own performance and curriculum, leading to adjustments in training. **[Attachments 9A, 9B, 9C and 9D: Example FTFO Course Student Evaluations]**

Regular training provided by FTFO is frequently adjusted to address emerging trends or other identified concerns and to ensure consistent representation of policy, procedure, and expectations to members. The unit's Critical Mindset, Coordinated Response (CMCR) course is a primary example. Utilizing force-on-force scenario-based training, CMCR hones officers' coordinated tactics, by reinforcing concepts intended to mitigate the need or level of force in high risk encounters. Core principles of the training include: Critical Decision Making, planning and coordination, leadership, communication, and effective debriefing. **[Refer to Attachment 7: CMCR handout]** This course is offered monthly in 2-day version, in which members may enroll, as well as a one-day version that all members receive as part of their bi-annual recertification. Scenarios within this training are frequently adjusted to address concerns and trends that have been identified by the unit, the Training Division, the Command Staff or other stakeholders, and to present students with new challenges based on actual incidents



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

experienced by the SFPD or other agencies. **[Refer to Attachment 8: Copy of Sergeant Bugarin’s Email, “Scenario Change – LEP,” dated 07/27/20.]**

Other training has been developed by the unit to educate officers regarding specific use of force issues or developments impacting them. For example, in 2020, in response to changes in California’s use of force laws were changed, the unit prepared a Department Bulletin that provided all members an overview of the changes to state law and their impact on policy.

[Attachment 10: DB 20-011, Modifications to California’s Use of Force Standard (AB392)]

The unit also put together a responsive in-service course, which includes practical scenarios in the Force Options Simulator **[Attachment 11: AB392 Update course announcement]**. In addition to a stand-alone version of the class, members who attend their bi-annual recertification receive this training as part of their Continuing Professional Training (CPT).

The FTFO Unit also provides update training to patrol via “Office Hours” live training. During scheduled in-office or at-station lineup/roll-call sessions, FTFO trainers educate officers on emerging topics or address issues confronting members, such as vehicle approach options, utilization of discretionary time, coordinated response, or properly addressing a vehicular threat. **[Attachment 12: Sample “Office Hours” session outline]** Unit-specific training has also been provided, either by direction or request, when a specific concern has been identified. This has been conducted as a debriefing, refresher training, or teaching of a new technique or topic. For example, after a high risk incident involving a fleeing vehicle, the unit led a tactical debriefing at the involved station, at the request of station leadership, in order to effectively analyze and learn from the incident. In another circumstance, members of a station requested refresher training when their own debriefing after a barricaded suspect incident led the members to conclude that they had not effectively coordinated or managed their response.

Materials are also pushed out to members for consideration at their convenience. Videos are also a tool used to distribute lessons learned, remind officers of tactical considerations, or to address topics about which members may have requested more information. The videos are an effective means of mass distribution of principles and lessons. FTFO videos have been created to address active attacker response refresher, tactical considerations related to traffic stops, or proper physical control of subjects. Please click on the following links to access the videos. **[Attachment 13: Active Shooter Video]** and **[Attachment 14: Traffic Stop Tactics Video]**

Email is also used to quickly inform all sworn members about issues, training or resources available to them. Another of the methods is via Department Bulletins and Notices, which have been prepared to address emerging tactical patterns or challenges that have been identified, and remind members of procedures, strategies and resources they can utilize to successfully address these challenges. Topics include Use of the Extended Range Impact Weapon and Tactical Radio Communications.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Static resources have been made available to members. References, manuals, and resources, such as a checklist for writing Use of Force Reports, are available to all sworn members via a desktop folder when they are logged into a Department computer (VRP/Field Tactics Force Options Material). **[Attachment 15: VRP FTFO Screenshot].**

The FTFO Unit is staffed with experienced trainers who have extensive training and experience related to use of force. The current staff includes two members previously assigned to lead Department investigations of Officer-Involved Shootings, In-Custody Deaths, and significant Use of Force and members of the unit are expected and encouraged to continually train and improve. Two other current staff members have history in Special Operations, with notable experience as a training officer. All members of the unit possess Force Science Institute certifications in analysis of use of force incidents and realistic de-escalation, and members of the unit frequently attend outside training to ensure that they have exposure to best practices and other agencies. The trainers regularly interact with representatives and resources from other agencies, such as Los Angeles Police Department, San Jose Police Department, as well as associations with and resources from best practice organizations including POST, AELE, IACP, LEXIPOL, etc.,

Outside agencies are sought for guidance and feedback, and have participated in SFPD training to vet the training and obtain constructive criticism.

The unit also regularly meets with policy analysts from the Department of Police Accountability to discuss developments, trends, issues and concerns related to use of force training.

The knowledge, tools and resources developed through these interactions are invaluable in ensuring that training keeps pace with emerging best practices and changes in relevant law. Concepts and materials derived from all these resources are shared with members through



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

means described previously, as well as incorporated in training, to ensure that it not only meets the needs of officers, but is in accordance with law, policy and best practices.

Compliance Measures:

1) SFPD Training and Education Division report and analysis (synthesis) of the issues emerging from quarterly use of force.

Quarterly reports are prepared on different Use of Force topics, including the Early Intervention System Unit's Use of Force report and Internal Affairs Officer Involved Shooting Investigations report. These reports, which are only produced four times a year, provide helpful data to identify trends and areas of focus. The Field Training Force Options Unit was created to provide responsive, timely, consistent and effective use of force training. In order to achieve its objective, the unit has developed real time dashboard tools so that they can review and evaluate this information more frequently than on a quarterly basis and to review data in timeframes that provide a better sense of trends or patterns, while getting real-time data and analysis. Debriefings and reviews; quarterly reports; inter-disciplinary input and stakeholder input; and up-to-moment statistical analysis combine to inform the unit to identify tactical and use of force issues confronting specific members and the department as a whole. Data is evaluated in annual, quarterly, monthly or other increments, depending on the size of the representative data needed or useful.

The FTFO Unit was initially staffed in November 2018 and formally launched in May 2019. Use of Force training has been coordinated through the unit to ensure that such training is consistent and properly emphasizing particular aspects of changes in the law or preferred tactics. It is also to ensure that such training is responsive to identified trends and new threats confronting officers. The unit follows upon a foundation set by the Physical Training/Defensive Tactics (PT/DT) and Crisis Intervention Training (CIT) Units, which developed and delivered a coordinated 20-hour course in 2016 on new Use of Force policies and their practical application, including running through scenarios intended to enhance officer's de-escalation skills, officer safety, and tactical decision making. The training curriculum and delivery utilized the expertise of Tactical Division, CIT, and PT/DT members. Use of Force training now includes cross-disciplinary, consistent, and vetted use of force training, spearheaded by its Critical Mindset Coordinated Response (CMCR) course. Training is reviewed through and delivered by other units responsible for aspects of use of force training, including: PT/DT, CIT, the Recruit Training Office (RTO), Field Training Office (FTO), Physical Training/Defensive



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Tactics Unit (PT/DT), Continuing Professional Training (CPT), and Emergency Vehicle Operations Course (EVOC) Unit.

Based in part upon its analysis of several critical incidents (including OIS's involving multiple shooting officers), an emphasis of FTFO use of force training has been to reduce the use of deadly force options at complex, high-stress encounters. Once lethal force is sufficiently presented, officers are being taught to utilize "discretionary time" in order to identify and manage alternative options and actions. Training emphasizes on-scene leadership, communication, and tactical decision-making to enhance and utilize de-escalation. With sufficient deadly force deployed, officers are trained to assume other necessary functions, such as ERIW, arrest team, and "react" team to respond to changes in the totality of circumstances and reduce effects of stress-induced arousal. Techniques to identify, use, or enhance time and distance are introduced and practiced. For this reason, use of force training has placed greater emphasis on the deployment and use of the Extended Range Impact Weapon (ERIW) at complex, high risk incidents. This intermediate force option, which is the Department's "bean bag" option, enables officers to attempt to entice cooperation or coerce submission from behind cover, at a safe distance. (This concept is consistent with a correlation made in 2018 between LAPD's reported 31% increase in their use of "less lethal" bean bag rounds and their overall decline in Officer-Involved Shootings.) Officers are also educated in related tactical options and techniques, such as the advantages of utilizing a low-ready position when appropriate to provide officer safety with improved visual acuity. In addition, FTFO constantly reinforces the importance of role assignments at critical incidents, so that all officers on scene are not necessarily a lethal option and can be more effectively focused on an ancillary assignment.

In analyzing the efficacy of current training, FTFO reviewed available SFPD Officer Involved Shooting (OIS) data from January 1, 1999 to June 30, 2020 (Q3 2020) to derive the normal range for these incidents. In identifying OIS incidents for this purpose, FTFO applied the current definition (formalized in Department General Order 5.01 and first established on August 28, 2009 in DB 09-239) to all Officer-Involved uses of a firearm. In the reviewed period, SFPD averaged approximately 8.38 suspect-involved OIS per year, establishing a standard deviation of 3.74 over the 20-year period. In other words, when looking at two decades of historical data, SFPD has averaged roughly eight OIS incidents (+/-4) per year. Thus any year with a number outside the historic average range (i.e., between 4.64 and 12.12 per year) would be a statistical anomaly. In other words, when OIS's total either less than four or more than twelve in a single year, it represents a statistically significant deviation from the 20-year norm. In calendar year 2019, the SFPD had two Officer-Involved Shootings; in calendar year 2020 (to date), the Department has had one. These numbers are well below the normal historical range and statistically significant.

The unit also reviews overall use of force, and specific uses of force related to changes and developments in training. During the period from January 1, 2016 through December 31, 2018, Officers reported pointing a firearm an average of 64 times per



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

month. However, in the time period of January 1, 2019 through March 31, 2020, the monthly average dropped to 38 times per month. This is noteworthy in that it is 14.42 times below the established low standard deviation (52.42). Similarly, SFPD officers reported using force an average of 113.80 times per month during the same historic period. Since revisions in use of force training were introduced, use of force has fallen to a monthly average of 84.06 times, which is about 16 times fewer per month than the historic low standard deviation (100.76). In another category, the use of ERIW was utilized an average of 1.54 incidents per month before changes in training were implemented. Since January 1, 2019, ERIW usage has increased to a monthly average of 2.42 times. The increase is almost twice the historic mean average and slightly exceeds the historic high end standard deviation (2.40). The deployment of ERIW's at critical incidents to provide effective alternatives to deadly force options has been a point of emphasis in use of force training during the same timeframe.

Initial data infers that since the revisions in policy, training, and organization; improved training coordination and consistency imposed; and the delivery of revised, consistent use of force training, members are emphasizing or de-emphasizing force options in accordance with this training (as described above). The Single-day CMCR and the 2019-2020 Force Options Simulation courses rolled out for Continuing Professional Training (CPT) were the initial courses developed and presented through the FTFO Unit, emphasizing the tactics and tools as described above. Preliminary analysis of relevant captured data available through Business Intelligence tools suggests that such training is contributing to a reduction in general Use of Force and in Officer-Involved Shootings, specifically.

The following tables review historical averages and compare them to the relevant use of force data as derived from the Business Intelligence Unit dashboard.

Table 1. Trends in Relevant Use of Force Statistics

Category	Mean Avg (2016-19)	Standard Deviation	Mean Avg (19-1Q20)	Change in Mean Avg	Change %
Count of Reportable Use of Force (Monthly)	268.00	+/-54.68	166.00	-102.00	-38%
Incidents with a Reportable UOF (Monthly)	113.80	+/-13.04	84.06	-29.74	-26%
Count of Pointing a Firearm (Monthly)	171.00	+/-55.78	76.00	-95.00	-56%
Incidents with Pointing a Firearm (Monthly)	64.00	+/-11.58	38.00	-26.00	-40%
Incidents with ERIW Use (Monthly)	1.22	+/-1.18	2.42	+1.20	+98%
	(1998 through 2018)		(2019-2Q20)		
Officer Involved Shootings (Annual)	8.38	+/-3.74	2.00	-6.38	-76%
RED = The number is outside the standard deviation range (i.e., statistically significant)					
*In December 15, 2015, DB 15-255 mandated pointing a firearm at a subject as a reportable use of force. Consequently, this table uses data collected since 01/01/2016 for review of monthly data, since prior data may not have captured information relevant to this analysis.					



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

2) Evidence of roll-call/line-up announcements on emerging use of force trend resulting from analysis.

FTFO training utilizes a variety of resources and methods to deliver training.

Use of Force training utilizes a variety of methods—scenarios, video discussion, tabletop exercises, debriefings and open ended questions—to engage officers and develop their understanding of use of force issues and tactical considerations. Discussion and debate is strongly encouraged. Lively discussions have not only helped members better understand issues related to use of force, but have also provided the instructors with feedback about their own performance and curriculum, leading to adjustments in training.

-Attachment 9A (AB 392 Course Evaluation);

-Attachment 9B (FTFO Refresher Course Evaluation);

-Attachment 9C (Advanced Car Stops Tactics Course Evaluation); and

-Attachment 9D (Critical Mindset Course Evaluation);

Roll-call training is one type of training utilized. For example, Active Attacker Response roll-call training produced in 2020 addresses an identified training gap in addressing these types of high risk, low frequency type of critical incidents. This was comprised of a Department Bulletin sent to all members to announce the available training, including a link to the produced video and complementary materials for enhanced roll-call training at the stations.

-Attachment 13: Active Attack Video

-Attachment 17A: Department Bulletin 20-025, Active Attacker Training Video

-Attachment 17B: Active Attack Training Highlights

-Attachment 17C: Active Attack Response Sheet

Attachments 5A and 5B are examples from a specific critical incident (OIS) review, which identified concerns with broadcast communications during the incident. To support roll call training, FTFO unit prepared a responsive training notice, **(Attachment 6: DN 19-224)**, reminding members about the best practices and/or lessons learned relating to a specific OIS review. Other training communications and best practice resources are also made available to members through their VRP desktop material **(Attachment 15: VRP FTFO Screen Shot).**

The unit also provides update training to patrol via “Office Hours” training. During scheduled in-office or at-station lineup/roll-call sessions, FTFO trainers advance emerging topics or address issues confronting members, such as vehicle approach



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

options, utilization of discretionary time, coordinated response, or properly addressing a vehicular threat. **[Attachment 12: Sample “Office Hours” session outline]** Unit-specific training has also been provided, either by direction or request, when a specific concern has been identified. This has been conducted as a debriefing, refresher training to address a specific topic. For example, after a high risk incident involving a fleeing vehicle, the unit led a tactical debriefing at the station, at the request of station leadership, in order to effectively analyze and learn from the incident. In another circumstance, members of a station requested refresher training when their own debriefing after a barricaded suspect incident led the members to conclude that they had not effectively coordinated or managed their response.

3) Evidence that the announcements are educational and scenario-based in a way that encourages discussion regarding the use of force.

The following are examples of educational scenario-based training being utilized by FTFO to address emerging trends and issues, as derived from a variety of data and intelligence.

-Attachment 6 (DN 19-224);

-Attachment 9A (AB 392 Course Evaluation);

-Attachment 9B (FTFO Refresher Course Evaluation);

-Attachment 9C (Advanced Car Stops Tactics Course Evaluation);

-Attachment 9D (Critical Mindset Course Evaluation);

-Attachment 10 (DN- 20-011- Modifications to California’s Use of Force Standard AB 392);

-Attachment 11 (AB 392 Use of Force Update);

-Attachment 13 (Attack Active Video);

-Attachment 14 (Traffic Stop Video); and

-Attachment 15 (Example VRP FTFO Desktop Folder)

FTFO training utilizes scenarios, video discussion, tabletop exercises, debriefings and open-ended questions to engage officers and develop their understanding of use of force issues and tactical considerations. Discussion and debate is strongly encouraged. Lively discussions have not only helped members better understand issues related to use of force, but have also provided the instructors with feedback about their own performance and curriculum, leading to adjustments in training.

-Attachment 9A (AB 392 Course Evaluation);

-Attachment 9B (FTFO Refresher Course Evaluation);



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

-Attachment 9C (Advanced Car Stops Tactics Course Evaluation);

-Attachment 9D (Critical Mindset Course Evaluation);

Some training is developed by the unit to educate officers regarding specific issues or developments. For example, in 2020, in response to changes in California's use of force laws, the unit prepared a Department Bulletin that provided all members an overview of the changes to state law and their impact on policy. **[Attachment 10: DB 20-011, Modifications to California's Use of Force Standard (AB392)]** The unit also put together a responsive in-service course, which includes practical scenarios in the Force Options Simulator **[Attachment 11: AB392 Update course announcement]**. In addition to a stand-alone version of the class, members attending their bi-annual recertification receive this training as part of their Continuing Professional Training (CPT).

Another example is the Active Attack Response refresher training that was produced in 2020 to address a high risk, low frequency type of critical incident. This was comprised of a Department Bulletin sent to all members to announce the available training, including a link to the produced video and complementary materials.

- **Attachment 13: Active Attack Video**
- **Attachment 17A: Department Bulletin 20-025, Active Attacker Training Video**
- **Attachment 17B: Active Attack Training Highlights**
- **Attachment 17C: Active Attack Response Sheet**

Scenarios are adjusted to address concerns and trends that have been identified by the unit, the Training Division, the Command Staff or other stakeholders, and to present students with new challenges based on actual incidents experienced by the SFPD or other agencies. For example, a concern was expressed by stakeholders, who requested inclusion of a Limited English Proficiency component. CMCR training modified a force-on-force scenario to ensure that this was addressed. **[Refer to Attachment #8: Copy of Sergeant Bugarin's Email, "Scenario Change – LEP," dated 07/27/20.]**

4) Continual review/improvement loop to advance knowledge and information.

The following attachments provide process and product examples of how the newly formed Field Training Force Options Unit (Training Division) has been constructed to continually review and improve the department's training and knowledge on these issues. The FTFO unit is in place to deliver to members lessons related to use of force and related tactical conduct in the field. As memorialized in the FTFO Unit's Procedural Manual, instructors from the unit meet regularly with internal subject matter experts and instructors specializing in disciplines such as policy, procedures, and techniques to



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

ensure that training is uniform and consistent with recommended practices and evolving standards. This includes the Department of Police Accountability and other SFPD training units (such as Defensive Tactics, Continuing Professional Training, Field Training Office, Recruit Training Office, and CIT). Furthermore, other agencies, third party experts, professional associations, and outside training is utilized regularly to vet training and provide further perspective on developments affecting use of force training and ways to address them.

-Attachment 1 (DB 19-100, New Training Division Unit: Field Tactics/Force Options);

-Attachment 2 (FTFO Procedural Manual)

-Attachment 3 (FTFO Data Analysis: Power Point Slides)

-Attachment 4 (Sample FTFO Interdisciplinary Meeting Minutes)

-Attachment 5B (FTFO Incident Review 19-008)

-Attachment 8 (Copy of Sergeant Bugarin's Email, "Scenario Change- LEP, dated 07/27/20)

-Attachment 10 (DB 20-011, Modifications to California's Use of Force Standard 392)

-Attachment 12 (Sample "Office Hours" session outline)

-Attachment 13: Active Shooter Video

-Attachment 14: Traffic Stop Tactics Video

Use of Force instructors are encouraged to continue their training and development in order to keep abreast of emerging trends, best practices, new approaches, and issues impacting law enforcement, and to network with trainers from other agencies. The trainers regularly interact with representatives and resources from other agencies, such as Los Angeles Police Department, San Jose Police Department, as well as associations with and resources from best practice organizations including POST, AELE, IACP, LEXIPOL, etc.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Outside agencies are sought for guidance and feedback, and have participated in SFPD training to vet the training and obtain constructive criticism.

As stated in the FTFO Procedural Manual, the unit also regularly meets with policy analysts from the Department of Police Accountability to discuss developments, trends, issues and concerns related to use of force training.

-Attachment 16I: Email to DPA

Re UOF Analysis;

-Attachment 16J: Outlook Scheduler – Monthly Meeting with DPA

The knowledge, tools and resources developed through these interactions is invaluable in ensuring that training is keeping pace with emerging best practices and changes in relevant law. Concepts and materials derived from all these resources are shared with members through the means described previously, as well as incorporated in training, to ensure that it not only meets the needs of officers, but is in accordance with law, policy and best practices.