July 15, 2019

Honorable Police Commission
City and County of San Francisco
1245 3rd Street
San Francisco, CA 94158

Dear Commissioners:

RE: Second Quarter 2019: Audit of Electronic Communication Devices for Bias

As part of the Department's ongoing efforts to ensure organizational integrity regarding the potential for bias in department-issued communication devices, the Internal Affairs Division (IAD) has submitted the audit results for the Second Quarter 2019.

There are three platforms which are monitored for potential racial bias using a word list developed by the Department's Chief Information Officer; Level II (CLETS), E-mail, and text messages sent via Department-issued cellular phones.

It is important to note that due to system limitations, the audit process does not read the context of the words, as a result, false-positive hits may be generated. To validate the hit, the entire entry, e-mail message, or text that contains one of the words is thoroughly reviewed by IAD personnel to determine the context in which the term was used. Those hits determined to be potentially biased are investigated, and all others (false-positive hits) are archived.

**Level II: California Law Enforcement Telecommunications System (CLETS)**

A program was established which searches all entries made into this system using an established word list. The audit process is passive in nature and runs continuously. If a member uses one of the identified words, a "hit" is generated automatically and sent to IAD personnel via the Level II access portal. Each hit is printed, scanned, and saved to file. Staff analyzes every hit throughout the week, and those determined to be potentially biased are investigated.

*Second Quarter Results*

There were 6 hits returned and analyzed; none were determined to be potentially biased.
Department E-Mail:
All e-mails sent and received (internally and externally) through the Department's server are audited using an established word list. The audit process is passive in nature. If an e-mail contains one of the identified words on the list, a hit is generated automatically and sent to IAD personnel via an e-mail address exclusively used for this audit process. Those e-mails are saved and maintained on the server. Staff analyzes every hit, and those determined to be potentially biased are investigated.

Second Quarter Results
There were 493 hits returned and analyzed; none were determined to be potentially biased.

Text Messaging via Department-issued Cellular Phones:
Audits of text messages sent and received (internally and externally) via each Department issued phone is conducted by IAD. Staff is trained to conduct active audits using a program developed by the cellular provider, AT&T, and the Information Technology Division. Every 30 days, a search is done of all texts using an established word list. Additional terms can be used as well. Search parameters allow staff to search Department systems for historical texts if necessary. For data not available on local systems, the cellular provider will be contacted to determine if additional information still exists on their servers. Staff analyzes every hit to determine the context in which the term was used. Those hits determined to be potentially biased are investigated. All false-positive hits are saved by AT&T.

Second Quarter Results
There were 23 hits returned and analyzed; none were determined to be potentially biased.

Sincerely,

WILLIAM SCOTT
Chief of Police
## Audit Results 2nd Quarter (Apr-Jun 2019)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th># of Hits</th>
<th># of Confirmed Bias Hits by members of Department</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CLETS/LEVEL II</td>
<td>04/01/19-04/30/19</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>05/01/19-05/31/19</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>06/01/19-06/30/19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Totals:</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Totals of Conf. hits</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-mails</td>
<td>04/01/19-04/30/19</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>05/01/19-05/31/19</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>06/01/19-06/30/19</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Totals:</td>
<td>493</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Totals of Conf. hits</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texts</td>
<td>04/01/19-04/30/19</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>05/01/19-05/31/19</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>06/01/19-06/30/19</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Totals:</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Totals of Conf. hits</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All hits are evaluated by members of IAD for context to determine if they are related to bias. The all results for are from utilizing the new Bias word list approved 03/07/17.
Memorandum

San Francisco Police Department

To: Lt. Angela Wilhelm #716
Officer in Charge
Internal Affairs Division

From: Sgt. Jamie Hyun #81
Internal Affairs Division

Date: Monday, July 15, 2019

Subject: Second Quarter 2019 Bias Audit results

In regards to the SFPD Department Electronics Audit, members of the Internal Affairs Division have been tasked to monitor three systems for possible racial bias: Level II (CLETS), Department e-mail, and text messages from Department cellular phones. A breakdown of those audits for the second quarter of 2019 is below:

For Level II:
From April 1st to June 30th, there were 6 hits returned from the program. After review by IAD members, none of the 6 hits were determined to be biased oriented.

For Department e-mail:
From April 1st to June 30th, there were 493 hits returned from the program. After review by IAD members, none of the 493 hits were determined to be biased oriented.

For text messages:
From April 1st to June 30th, there were 23 hits returned from the program. After review by IAD members, none of the 23 hits were determined to be Department member generated biased hits.