

Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 1:16 PM

To: McGuire, Catherine (POL); Scott, William (POL); [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Subject: Cal DOJ's review of Recommendation 94.1

Dear Captain Bailey,

Our office has completed its review of the materials supporting implementation of Recommendation 94.1 that have been submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 94.1: The SFPD should identify its data needs for personnel and human resources analysis, including organizational diversity, succession and forecasting, training records, and separation data. The collection of data should allow the agency to conduct a barrier analysis.

Response to Recommendation 94.1: In April 2018, SFPD formed the Staffing and Deployment Unit (SDU), which is charged with collecting, maintaining, and analyzing personnel data to inform SFPD's staffing decisions. The SDU identified several categories of data it would need to help it determine personnel needs and a barrier analysis, including race and gender demographic data, vacancy data (vacant positions within each rank), and separation data. The SDU has also worked to identify gaps in available data and has taken measures to close those gaps. For example, SDU directed the modification of the Human Resources Management System in late 2018 so that it now collects information about sworn members who are not full duty and the reason for that status. This will enable SDU to identify trends related to the reasons members leave full duty status.

The SDU also holds biweekly meetings with command staff where it provides reports on personnel and human resources data, which command staff can then use to inform staffing decisions. The command staff also uses these meetings to make additional data analysis requests of the SDU. Further, the SDU also meets with the Administration Bureau, the Staff Services Division, and the City's Department of Human Resources on a quarterly basis to discuss demographic data and strategies to address demographic disparities. Finally, the SDU meets weekly to discuss data findings, needs, and to monitor progress on data analysis requests.

Based upon all of the above, the Department of Justice finds that SFPD is in substantial compliance with this recommendation. Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss these further. Thank you.

Tanya



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding # 94: The SFPD does not maintain, analyze, or use data to support and forecast human resource needs, including diversity staffing, succession, or basic demographics. The SFPD cannot readily identify basic demographic data on its employees or readily access training records, separation records, and other human resource data for analysis and development in the department.

Recommendation # 94.1 The SFPD should identify its data needs for personnel and human resource analysis, including organizational diversity, succession and forecasting, training records, and separation data. The collection of data should allow the agency to conduct a barrier analysis.

Response Date: 5/5/2020

Executive Summary:

When the Collaborative Reform Initiative was issued in October of 2016, much of the needed human resource data existed but was either difficult, or impossible in some cases, to extract for analytical purposes. Additionally, these datasets were often siloed in separate systems (i.e. disparate spreadsheets) and the Department was unable to combine them together, rendering the data useless in certain instances.

In April of 2018, the San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) formed the Staffing and Deployment Unit (SDU) (see Department Bulletin 18-073, [attachment 1](#); Staffing and Deployment Unit PowerPoint presentation (presented to newly promoted Lieutenants and Captains on 11-7-18), [attachment 2](#); and DOJ Recommendations 94.1 and 94.2 PowerPoint presentation (presented to the Executive Sponsor Working Group – 5/9/19), [attachment 3](#)) to be a centralized and impartial unit that collects, maintains, and analyzes personnel data and serves as a repository for such data. Through its focus on providing information to decision makers and emphasis on data driven staffing, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has worked with the Department's executive level Command Staff and SFPD Human Resources to identify the department's data needs for personnel and human resource analysis, and to implement projects to facilitate the collection and analysis of this data. With personnel data easily accessible, it is now possible to conduct ongoing and needed barrier analyses moving forward.

Compliance Measures:

1) Identify data needs that will support the staffing and resource planning for the SFPD.

SFPD needs the following data to support the staffing and resource planning for the Department:



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- Demographic Data (including both race and sex)
- Language Skill Data
- Tenure Data (age and length of service)
- Vacancy Data (vacant positions within each rank)
- Assignment Data (related to both individual members as well as specific positions)
- Full Duty Status Data
- Separation Data
- Training Records Data

The aforementioned data needs were established by the Staffing and Deployment Unit in order to support organizational diversity, succession planning, forecasting, and the enablement of barrier analyses for Department employees in all ranks and assignments.

2) Assess gaps in the available data.

At this time, all known gaps in available data have been identified, assessed, and remedied by the Staffing and Deployment Unit. The Staffing and Deployment Unit has overcome major gaps in available data by modifying and de-siloing data management systems to allow for robust data collection and analysis.

One such example of this gap assessment pertains to the full duty status of SFPD employees. The Staffing and Deployment Unit made a modification to the Department's Human Resources Management System (HRMS) in late 2018 to allow for the collection of data regarding SFPD sworn members who are not considered "full duty" and the associated reasons for which this is the case (disability, temporary modified duty, military leave, family or medical leave, disciplinary conditions, etc.), as this information is critical to the monitoring of staffing levels and human resource needs. Prior to the modification of HRMS to allow for the standardized collection of this data, full duty information was hand counted and not easily accessible in one place. Full duty status information can now be found in a report in HRMS (see Central Station Seniority Report – 8/21/19, [attachment 4](#)) as well as a more comprehensive report created by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and provided to Command Staff on a biweekly basis (see Example SFPD Citywide Current Sworn Staffing – 5/6/19, [attachment 5](#)).

Another example of gap assessment and rectification was the modification of HRMS to include specific sworn employee status such as Academy Recruit, Field Training Recruit, Probation, and Permanent employee. This information was also always previously captured in different places and difficult data to obtain. This information is now easily extractable from the HRMS system, which allows the Staffing and Deployment Unit to utilize this data when needed.

Despite the fact that all known gaps have already been assessed and rectified, the Staffing and Deployment Unit is continually monitoring for any additional gaps in available data that may arise. As gaps are identified, the Staffing and Deployment Unit works to not only obtain the necessary information, but also incorporate it into existing



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

data management systems (such as the Human Resources Management System (HRMS)) from which data can be extracted and analyzed. Additionally, in the event that data gaps arise in the future, the data collection plan outlined below would be modified to incorporate the collection of newly identified necessary data and the associated timeline and future goals.

3) Develop a plan to collect available data and establish future data goals and timeline.

An initial plan for responding to DOJ Recommendation 94.1 was outlined in a PowerPoint presentation presented to the Executive Sponsor Working Group on May 9, 2019 (see DOJ Recommendations 94.1 and 94.2 PowerPoint presentation, [attachment 3](#)). In summary, initially, the plan consisted of the formation of the Staffing and Deployment Unit in April of 2018 to identify personnel and human resources data, serve as a repository for all data and analyses related to staffing, and to prioritize that this data informs and supports management decisions. The Staffing and Deployment Unit emphasized data driven staffing and the creation of repeatable and transparent processes to assist in informing and realizing staffing decisions. Early projects and initiatives included the development of Position Control Numbers, previous assignment history arrays, Business Intelligence utilization for training and scheduling analysis, retirement and separation monitoring, and full duty status data collection and reporting. These projects were discussed in biweekly staffing meetings hosted by the Staffing and Deployment Unit with members of Command Staff. The intention of these meetings was and continues to be to provide regular reports and status updates on personnel and human resources data and to provide a forum for decision makers to convene regularly to review and discuss this data. Since then, the plan has evolved and expanded even further.

The current plan to collect available data and establish future data goals and timelines is as follows and has been in place since early 2019:

1. The Staffing and Deployment Unit collects and maintains personnel data and serves as a repository for such data. As mentioned previously, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has been responsible for this since it was formed in April of 2018 and has an experienced senior analyst on staff who is dedicated to these missions (see Department Bulletin 18-073, [attachment 1](#), and Staffing and Deployment Unit PowerPoint presentation (presented to newly promoted Lieutenants and Captains on 11-7-18), [attachment 2](#)).
2. The Staffing and Deployment Unit analyzes the personnel data on an ongoing as well as ad hoc basis when requested to provide updated information, patterns, and trends. These analyses are done by joining datasets and utilizing the data visualization software, Tableau, to create dashboards that allow information to be filtered and, thus, specific questions of interest to be answered.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

3. The collected data and resulting analyses are then disseminated to Command Staff in regular biweekly intervals. This information is disseminated in two ways: first, via a shared desktop Command Staff folder in which the Staffing and Deployment Unit places all personnel related analyses and Tableau dashboards, putting the information at Command Staff's fingertips when needed; and second, via a biweekly staffing meeting facilitated by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and attended by all Assistant Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs in person (see Example Assistant Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs Meeting Agenda from February 24th, 2020, and January 27th, 2020, [attachment 15](#)). At these meetings, the Staffing and Deployment Unit presents "Human Resources Data Dashboard Updates" as a standing agenda item which include reports and dashboard updates on personnel and human resources data, including demographic information, vacancy information, separation information, full duty status information, assignment information, etc.
4. At these biweekly staffing meetings, Command Staff communicates any future data goals or further data analysis requests they may have to the Staffing and Deployment Unit who then executes them as quickly as possible. Results of subsequent requested analyses are presented at the next biweekly staffing meeting or provided directly to the requestor as soon as completed.
5. Outside of the staffing meetings, Command Staff and the Chief of Police also make data analysis requests directly to the Staffing and Deployment Unit on an ad hoc basis as needs arise. These requests are prioritized and completed in order of importance and time sensitivity. The prioritization is done internally by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and is determined by the rank of requestor, the purpose for which the data and/or analysis is needed (i.e. a Police Commission meeting, a meeting with the Mayor's Office, a Board of Supervisors hearing, internal Department monitoring, etc.), and the timeframe within which the data is needed (see Staffing and Deployment Unit Projects and Tasks, [attachment 30](#)). At the most basic level, requests for data related to a meeting scheduled for the next day are prioritized over data requests needed in the coming weeks. Requests made by the Chief of Police are prioritized over requests made by a District Station captain. Requests made to prepare for hearings before the Board of Supervisors are prioritized over internal curiosity inquiries. Also, multiple projects are worked on simultaneously by different members of the Staffing and Deployment Unit team to ensure data analyses are completed in a timely manner and commensurate with the needs of the requestors and the Department.
6. The Staffing and Deployment Unit also prepares personnel information and analyses for dissemination to internal and external City stakeholders such as the Police Commission, the Mayor's Office, the Board of Supervisors, and the Office of the Controller upon request.
7. In addition to the requests and feedback provided by Command Staff, the Staffing and Deployment Unit meets weekly internally as a team to discuss current projects



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

in progress and any potential future data goals that they see a need for and the priority and timeline under which they will be accomplished (see Example Staffing and Deployment Unit Fiscal Year 2019-20 Running Check-Ins Agenda, [attachment 24](#)). This meeting is also utilized to discuss data collection issues that may have arisen and to develop plans to rectify those issues.

8. The Staffing and Deployment Unit also meets biweekly with the Captain of Staff Services, the Commander of the Administration Bureau, and the Deputy Chief of the Administration Bureau, to discuss current projects and any issues that are being faced (see Example Bi-Weekly Staffing and Deployment Unit Meeting Agenda – 7/31/19, [attachment 25](#)). This meeting also provides a forum to discuss future data goals and timelines.
9. In addition to the weekly and biweekly meetings already mentioned, a quarterly hiring meeting is also held with members of the Administration Bureau, including the Staff Services Division (Recruitment Unit, Backgrounds Unit, and the Staffing and Deployment Unit) and the Training Division (Academy), as well as the City's overarching Department of Human Resources. In this meeting, demographic data as it pertains to the hiring and training process is discussed and strategies developed to address any identified disparities (see Recruitment and Hiring Committee Quarterly Meeting Minutes – 3/11/18 and March 2019 Hiring Summary – Q2, [attachment 26](#)).
10. These weekly, biweekly, and quarterly meetings, provide a mechanism for the identification of future data goals. The future data goals and plans are dependent upon the changing needs of the Department and of the City as both shift, grow, and evolve over time. As new issues are encountered, SFPD finally has a process in place to analyze and respond.
11. Ultimately, once data goals are identified, future timelines are established by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and projects and analyses prioritized by time sensitivity and importance. These future data goal timelines are specifically established by the Lieutenant of the Staffing and Deployment Unit (unless specific direction is received from Command Staff) and based on the following factors: the rank of the requestor, the purpose for which the data and/or analysis is needed, the urgency of the data need, and the overall benefit and utility of the data to the Department. Timeline progress is monitored internally by the Staffing and Deployment Unit at their weekly check-in meeting as outlined in Step 7 (see Example Staffing and Deployment Unit Fiscal Year 2019-20 Running Check-Ins Agenda, [attachment 24](#)). The Staffing and Deployment Unit also keeps a list of projects and tasks and their associated timelines (see Staffing and Deployment Unit Projects and Tasks, [attachment 30](#)). These timelines are also monitored at the Staffing and Deployment Unit's biweekly meeting with the Captain of Staff Services, the Commander of the Administration Bureau, and the Deputy Chief of the



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Administration Bureau as outlined in Step 8 (see Example Bi-Weekly Staffing and Deployment Unit Meeting Agenda – 7/31/19, [attachment 25](#)).

Specific detail about how the Staffing and Deployment Unit collects and utilizes each of the datasets mentioned in Compliance Measure #1 is as follows:

- **Demographic Data:** Race and gender data are housed in the Department's HRMS system. An automatic report breaking down the Department by race, gender, and rank is now available and can be run in real time (see Department Statistics Report – 8/21/19, [attachment 6](#)). This report is distributed to Command Staff on a monthly basis but is also available as needed.

The Staffing and Deployment Unit is maintaining historical data related to demographic trends as well. A dashboard has been created detailing a 10-year time series (2008-2018) of demographic breakdowns by race and by gender (see Gender Breakdown by Year and Race Breakdown by Year, [attachment 7](#)). This dashboard can be queried by rank and is available to Command Staff for review as needed. The Staffing and Deployment Unit will continue to add year end demographic data annually.

Additionally, the Staffing and Deployment Unit extracts demographic data from HRMS and combines it with rank data and assignment data (also from HRMS) via the data visualization software, Tableau, to create interactive dashboards that Command Staff can utilize (through Tableau Reader) to glean any necessary information for staffing decisions (see Screen Capture of Race and Gender Dashboard – "Race and Gender Breakdown by Department (Sworn Full Duty Only, [attachment 8](#))).

Demographic data as it relates to promotions has also been collected and analyzed for all supervisory ranks (sergeant, lieutenant, captain, commander, deputy chief, assistant chief, and chief) by the Staffing and Deployment Unit (see Promotion to Sergeant 2010-2018 by Race, Promotion to Sergeant 2010-2018 by Gender, Promotion to Lieutenant 2010-2018 by Race, Promotion to Lieutenant 2010-2018 by Gender, Promotion to Captain 2010-2018 by Race, Promotion to Captain 2010-2018 by Gender, Promotion to Commander 2010-2019 by Race, Promotion to Commander 2010-2019 by Gender, Promotion to Deputy Chief 2010-2019 by Race, Promotion to Deputy Chief 2010-2019 by Gender, Promotion to Assistant Chief and Chief 2010-2019 by Race, and Promotion to Assistant Chief and Chief 2010-2019 by Gender, [attachment 9](#)). This information is maintained by the Staffing and Deployment Unit on an ongoing basis as promotions occur.

Demographic data is used for a variety of purposes. One such example is the use of demographic data by the Staffing and Deployment Unit in assignment decisions to achieve the goal of maintaining a diverse workforce across the City. For instance, SFPD is typically approximately 15% female overall. If a District Station's



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

demographic data shows them below 15% female, the Staffing and Deployment Unit would aim to place a female officer at that District Station to bring it closer in line with the Department's overall demographics.

Another example is that demographic data is examined as it relates to separations in order to ascertain whether certain groups are being disproportionately affected in comparison to others as it relates to things such as training failures and disciplinary terminations.

Demographic data has already been collected, is the subject of ongoing analyses, and is being utilized by Command Staff via dashboards and reports for the purposes of examining and monitoring organizational diversity.

- **Language Skill Data:** Language skill information is housed in the HRMS system. This data is input and maintained by the LEP Coordinator at the Community Engagement Division (CED). A report can be run in real time that documents which officers speak which languages and whether or not they are Department certified to act as interpreters (see Language Proficiency Report – 8/21/19, [attachment 10](#)).

Additionally, language skill information is also provided to the Staffing and Deployment Unit by the Field Training Office in a spreadsheet that details which FTO recruits speak which languages (see Probation to Permanent Transfer Spreadsheet – Recruit Class 256 – 1/25/19, [attachment 11](#)).

The Staffing and Deployment Unit aims to disseminate language access across the City commensurate with the needs of the Department and the communities we serve. If a District Station has a specific need for a member who speaks a certain language or if the community that District Station serves has a large population of individuals who speak a certain language, the Staffing and Deployment Unit would factor that in when making assignment decisions based on the language skill data in their possession.

Language skill data has already been collected and is being utilized by the Staffing and Deployment Unit to inform staffing decisions.

- **Tenure Data:** Employee age and years of service information is housed in HRMS as well as the city-wide Emerge system. This data is input and maintained by SFPD Human Resources. Additionally, SFPD Human Resources runs a weekly report in Emerge detailing SFPD employees who have declared a retirement date with the San Francisco Employee's Retirement System (SFERS), the City's retirement agency (see POI Report – 8/12/19, [attachment 12](#)).

In terms of succession planning, the Staffing and Deployment Unit monitors reported upcoming retirements and continues to analyze who and how many employees are retirement-eligible by age and years of service (see Department Summary of Years



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

of Service – January 2019, attachment 13). This information has been incorporated into a Tableau dashboard that allows for forecasting of who may be retiring (and from what rank and assignment) not only in the current year, but in the years to come as well (see Succession Planning: Age and Years of Service, attachment 14). This information is a standing agenda item at the biweekly staffing management meetings attended by the Assistant Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs and is utilized to predict upcoming potential vacancies (see Example Assistant Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs Staffing Meeting Agenda from February 24th, 2020, and January 27th, 2020, attachment 15).

Tenure data has already been collected, is the subject of ongoing analyses, and is being utilized by Command Staff for succession planning and forecasting purposes

- **Vacancy Data:** The Staffing and Deployment Unit has created a Position Control Number system, housed in HRMS, to track position vacancies. Prior to the undertaking of this project, it was impossible to accurately track vacancies at the level of detail necessary (see Position Control Number Overview, attachment 16). Emerge was only able to allow for the tracking of vacancies by rank and funding source, not assignment. With Position Control Numbers, we now have a mechanism to store specific position vacancy information and easily identify which vacancies currently exist through the generation of a report in HRMS (see Vacant Position Report – 8/21/19, attachment 17).

The Staffing and Deployment Unit has also created automated reports to track vacancies and other staffing-related information in order to monitor and plan for major staffing decisions such as transfers and promotions. These reports, created in Tableau and utilizing information from the Emerge system, provide information on budgeted and filled positions by rank and funding source (see Police Positions – Budget Snapshot (April 26, 2019 / PO #8, attachment 18).

Vacancy data is used to highlight current staffing needs and to create timelines for filling those staffing needs with the hiring of sworn and civilian staff. The Staffing and Deployment Unit works regularly with SFPD Human Resources and the Fiscal Division to accomplish this. Vacancy data is also used to inform the annual budget process.

Vacancy data has already been collected, is the subject of ongoing analyses, and the aforementioned tools and reports are utilized and reviewed by Command Staff for succession planning and forecasting purposes.

- **Assignment Data:** Assignment data is housed in the HRMS system. Specific assignment data, including historical data, is easily queried in HRMS on the individual level as well as the unit level as a whole (see Central Station Seniority



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Report – 8/21/19, [attachment 4](#)). As mentioned previously, the Staffing and Deployment Unit extracts assignment data, rank data and demographic data from HRMS and utilizes interactive Tableau dashboards to allow for more granular analyses. Specifically, sworn assignment data is available to Command Staff through an interactive Tableau dashboard that includes bureau, unit / division / station, rank, full duty status (discussed in detail below), and name (see Sworn Personnel by Bureau and Department ID, [attachment 19](#)). This dashboard is updated regularly on a biweekly basis.

Additionally, an initial effort to track demographics as they relate to employees and assignments was undertaken at the start of this project (see Active Captains' Array – Assignment History – 9/15/17 and Active Lieutenants' Array – Assignment History – 9/15/17, [attachment 20](#)). However, this process was extremely time consuming as it had to be done manually. As mentioned previously, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has since created and implemented a Position Control Number system in HRMS which not only allows for the tracking of assignment vacancies, but also enables the department to determine the employee history of a particular position in order to track demographic goals, and to determine the position history of a particular employee in order to track professional development (see Position Control Numbers Overview, [attachment 16](#)). The implementation of Position Control Numbers has automated the previously manual process and has established a method and system for continuous review and an improvement loop for SFPD staffing needs.

Assignment data speaks to who has what position, for how long they have had it, and allows for discussion regarding whether new and/or more diverse opportunities should be afforded to individuals. For instance, when promotions are made, assignment data histories are reviewed to see where individuals can lend certain skill sets or where new opportunities are warranted for breadth of experience.

Assignment data has already been collected, is the subject of ongoing analyses, and is utilized by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and Command Staff for the monitoring of organizational diversity, succession planning, and forecasting.

- **Full Duty Status Data:** Full duty status information is now collected and input into HRMS by the Staffing and Deployment Unit. As mentioned previously, the Staffing and Deployment Unit made a modification to HRMS in late 2018 to allow for the collection of data regarding SFPD sworn members who are not considered "full duty" and the associated reasons for which this is the case (disability, temporary modified duty, military leave, family or medical leave, disciplinary conditions, etc.). This was a collaborative effort between the Staffing and Deployment Unit and the Technology Division. Knowing the number of full duty employees is crucial because the San Francisco Police Department has a City Charter mandated staffing level of 1,971 full



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

duty sworn employees. The Staffing and Deployment Unit is responsible for monitoring these levels.

Prior to the modification of HRMS to allow for the standardized collection of this data, full duty information was hand counted and not easily accessible in one place. Full duty status information can now be found in a report in HRMS that notes members who are not considered full duty by assignment (see Central Station Seniority Report – 8/21/19, [attachment 4](#)). Additionally, the Staffing and Deployment Unit produces a more comprehensive point-in-time overview of full duty and not full duty personnel in the Department on a biweekly basis (see SFPD Citywide Current Sworn Staffing – 5/6/19, [attachment 5](#)).

This information has also been incorporated into interactive Tableau dashboards updated biweekly and provided to Command Staff that allow for trend analysis of full duty status overall and by less than full duty category over time, as well as by assignment and rank (see Full Duty and Not Full Duty Trend Analysis, Trend Analysis: Full Duty Q2s in Patrol (All District Stations), and Sworn Personnel by Bureau and Department ID, [attachment 27](#)).

Full duty status speaks to who is available to work and in what capacity. When employees are no longer full duty, an assessment of the data is made by Command Staff and the Staffing and Deployment Unit regarding whether or not to backfill staffing at those assignments in the immediate or potentially the future.

Full duty status data collection is occurring on an ongoing basis and is utilized by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and Command Staff for forecasting purposes and to inform staffing-related decisions.

- **Separation Data:** Separation data is monitored by the SFPD's Human Resources and Payroll functions, both of which sit in the Staff Services Division, along with the Staffing and Deployment Unit. The Staffing and Deployment Unit monitors separation data via a spreadsheet that divides the data into categories of retirements, resignations / terminations, separations in Academy / FTO, and deaths (see Police Sworn Terminations by Category – 8/21/19, [attachment 21](#)). This data is collected by fiscal year (beginning in FY 2005-2006) which allows for comparison and trend analysis by the Staffing and Deployment Unit.

This data has also been incorporated into Tableau dashboards that are provided to Command Staff and updated on a biweekly basis (see Non-Training, Non-Service Separations: Overview, Non-Training or Service Separations: Drilldown, and Non-Training or Service Separations: Drilldown, [attachment 22](#)). These dashboards incorporate the separation trends year over year by category (resignation, retired, released / terminated), information regarding why people are separating (i.e. lateral



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

hire at another police agency, disciplinary, medical, etc.), and information related to who is separating (rank, years of service, gender, and race).

Additionally, Human Resources and the Staffing and Deployment Unit worked together to develop a template for collecting separation data that is currently in use and will be used to conduct barrier and other analyses on separations in the future (see Example Separation Questionnaire for Academy Recruits, [attachment 23](#)).

The Staffing and Deployment Unit is constantly reviewing separation data to determine how many people are leaving the Department and for what reason. A recent trend is that sworn officers are leaving SFPD to lateral to other law enforcement agencies in greater numbers than ever before. Because the trend has been identified via the data, the Department is working on retention solutions to address this issue. Reviewing the separation data also allows the Staffing and Deployment Unit to predict annual attrition rates for backfill and hiring purposes in the immediate and longer term, years down the road.

Separation data is being collected and analyzed regularly and is being utilized by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and Command Staff to monitor trends and for forecasting purposes.

- **Training Records Data:** Training records are currently housed in the HRMS system. These records are input and maintained by the Academy. SFPD's training data that was housed in HRMS has been linked to SFPD's in-house Oracle Business Intelligence (BI) system (see Screen Capture of Business Intelligence Training Analytics Module). This was a project completed by SFPD's Technology Division. SFPD's BI system now contains extensive training records that can be queried to obtain specific data such as employee information, training dates, and course information including name, duration, location, etc.

Training record data is utilized to monitor professional development, skill sets, and parity as it relates to the affordance of training opportunities. Training record data collection and review is ongoing but, with the systems in place, is considered complete timeline-wise.

Training record data is being collected on an ongoing basis and is now easily accessible for analytical purposes through its integration into Oracle BI.

In conclusion, the overarching plan is to utilize the Staffing and Deployment Unit to collect, maintain, and analyze the aforementioned personnel related datasets in the manners described above. The data is then disseminated and discussed in depth at multiple different meetings as well as on an ad hoc basis to answer questions and to examine trends. As issues arise and additional questions are posed, the Staffing and Deployment Unit establishes future data goals and associated timelines and executes those goals



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

accordingly. The Staffing and Deployment Unit then pushes newly requested information back out both internally and externally for use in decision making.

4) Identify barriers to implementation of the plan.

As of today's date, there are no barriers to the implementation of the plan.

5) Establish planning goals to overcome barriers.

As of today's date, there are no standing barriers to the implementation of the plan at this point and, thus, there are no associated planning goals to overcome those barriers. Should barriers arise in the future, the Staffing and Deployment Unit will be responsible for establishing any needed planning goals moving forward.

6) Continuous review and improvement loop.

The Staffing and Deployment Unit collects, maintains, monitors, and analyzes personnel data on an ongoing basis with the goal of supporting department initiatives. This unit has been tasked with the continuous and ongoing assessment of data needs, data analyses, and data dissemination.

The Staffing and Deployment Unit keeps a list of future data goal projects and tasks and their associated timelines (see Staffing and Deployment Unit Projects and Tasks, [attachment 30](#)).

The Staffing and Deployment Unit also meets weekly as a team to discuss data findings, data needs, and data issues and to brainstorm solutions and goals (see Example Staffing and Deployment Unit Fiscal Year 2019-20 Running Check-Ins Agenda, [attachment 24](#)). In addition, the Staffing and Deployment Unit meets biweekly with Administration Bureau Command Staff to disseminate information and problem solve (see Example Bi-Weekly Staffing and Deployment Unit Meeting Agenda – 7/31/19, [attachment 25](#)). Both meetings serve as a mechanism to regularly monitor progress and check-in regarding goals and timelines. In these meetings, projects and tasks are discussed in detail, questions asked and answered, and status updates provided.

Recurring biweekly staffing meetings with the Assistant Chiefs, Deputy Chiefs and the Staffing and Deployment Unit have also been implemented (see Example Assistant Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs Meeting Agenda from February 24th, 2020, and January 27th, 2020, [attachment 15](#)). The Staffing and Deployment Unit provides verbal status updates on data collection and analyses, as well as prepares reports and dashboards on personnel and human resources data for these meetings, including demographic information, vacancy information, separation information, full duty status information, assignment information, etc, to demonstrate such status updates. These updates / discussions were previously listed as "Dashboard Updates" on the meeting agendas but are now being listed as "Human Resources Data Dashboard Updates" for greater



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

clarity, as well as the specific topics being discussed itemized (such as separation trends, demographic trends, full duty status trends, etc.). These meetings ultimately serve as a forum for decision-makers to convene regularly to review and discuss this human resources data.

At these biweekly staffing meetings, Command Staff communicates any future data goals or further data analysis requests they may have to the Staffing and Deployment Unit who then executes them as quickly as possible. Results of subsequent requested analyses are presented at the next biweekly staffing meeting or provided directly to the requestor as soon as completed. One such example of this is related to separation data. In an effort to understand an increased trend in people separating from the Department prior to official retirement eligibility, as discussed in a meeting with the Assistant Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs, the Staffing and Deployment Unit established a method of collecting exit interview information from SFPD Human Resources and now incorporates that information into dashboards to understand the reasons why people are resigning (see Non-Training or Service Separations: Drilldown). This specific dashboard was recently presented to the Chief of Police who requested the addition of officers' home towns to try to understand if people were leaving SFPD to go to law enforcement agencies that were closer to home. That modification was immediately made by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and is now a permanent addition to that dashboard.

Due to the sensitivity of the discussions being had in these staffing meetings, minutes are not kept. However, new sections have been added to the meeting agendas that will be used moving forward (see Example Assistant Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs Meeting Agenda for May 4th, 2020, [attachment 28](#)). This includes a "Follow Up Action Items from Previous Meeting" section that itemizes data requests made at the meeting prior that require revisiting. One example of this is that in the staffing meeting held on April 22, 2020, an Assistant Chief requested an analysis on the average number of temporary modified duty personnel per month for the purposes of potentially staffing a new Report Writing Unit. In the meeting agenda for the next meeting that will be held on May 4, 2020, this is included as a follow up item as well as the resulting trend analysis that was completed (see TMD Trend: January 2019 – Present, [attachment 29](#)). Additionally, an "Items for Follow Up at Next Meeting" section will be added to all forthcoming meeting agendas and will be used to recap action items expected for the next meeting.

In addition to the weekly and biweekly meetings already mentioned, a quarterly hiring meeting is also held with members of the Administration Bureau, including the Staff Services Division (Recruitment Unit, Backgrounds Unit, and the Staffing and Deployment Unit) and the Training Division (Academy), as well as the City's overarching Department of Human Resources. In this meeting, demographic data as it pertains to the hiring and training process is discussed and strategies developed to address any



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

identified disparities (see Recruitment and Hiring Committee Quarterly Meeting Minutes – 3/11/18 and March 2019 Hiring Summary – Q2, [attachment 26](#)). This review of hiring demographics specifically addresses organizational diversity and forecasting.

The San Francisco Police Department attempts to stay at the forefront of best practices in relation to data, personnel and human resources data in particular. The Staffing and Deployment Unit shadowed the Los Angeles Police Department's Field Deployment Unit in 2018 with the goal of understanding how they collect data and why, as it relates to staffing and deployment of personnel. Additionally, members of the Staffing and Deployment Unit attended the International Association of Chiefs of Police conference in October of 2018 to gather information about data management and use. The Staffing and Deployment Unit also participates in the SFPD Data Analysis Working Group (DAWG). The purpose of DAWG is to share analytical problems, identify gaps, and work towards solutions for resolution of issues.