

From: [Tanya Koshy](#)
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: Recommendation 85.1
Date: Friday, September 10, 2021 5:29:24 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer:

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 85.1 that have been submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 85.1: The SFPD should continue supporting and overseeing this initiative and ensure the Recruitment Unit continues to implement best practices for recruitment, training, and outreach to improve diversity and cultural and linguistic responsiveness of the SFPD.

Response to 85.1:

SFPD employs a number of mechanisms to oversee recruitment activities. First, recruitment activities must be approved by a chain of command via a memo. The chain of command is as follows: Recruiter, Recruitment Sergeant, Staff Services Lieutenant, Staff Services Captain, Administration Bureau Commander, Administration Bureau Deputy Chief, and finally, the Chief of Police. However, not all requests require going through the full chain of command.

The City of San Francisco's Department of Human Resources (DHR) also participates in a hiring committee with SFPD, which provides further oversight. This committee meets quarterly and consists of DHR's Public Safety Team, SFPD's Recruitment Unit, the Background Investigation Unit, the Staff Services Division, the Basic Academy, and the Field Training Program. Each unit provides an update on their practices and future plans and ensure momentum and accountability for various hiring and recruitment goals. The hiring committee's policies and practices are described in more detail in Unit Order 17-05 as well as in the email summaries finding SFPD in substantial compliance with Recommendations 84.1 and 84.2.

Finally, the Recruitment Unit provides a Year End Review, which is codified in Unit Order 20-02 ("Recruitment Unit - Year End Review Report," issued August 1, 2020). The yearly review includes an assessment of recruitment events and activities, applicant contacts, media advertising, and recruitment strategies. SFPD has also outlined short term and long term strategies for reaching recruitment and hiring goals in the yearly reports including: (1) expansion of recruitment efforts into previously unexplored geographic territory; (2) exploring new cultural/social venues for outreach; (3) advertising focusing on the contemporary workforce/generation's needs and interests by using updated social-media platforms; and (4) rethinking benefits packages, work/life support (scheduling/childcare/professional development).

Beyond oversight, SFPD has also provided support for recruitment in a number of ways. First, SFPD has allocated \$250,000 of its annual budget to fund recruitment activities, programs, and expenses. Second, SFPD has detailed more recruitment personnel and resources to recruitment events. SFPD notes that while requests for more support for recruitment must be approved by the chain of command, these requests are rarely completely denied.

Third, on an annual basis, the Recruitment Unit sends at least two of its unit members to external trainings on police recruitment. This policy is codified in Unit Order 17-07. After unit members attend a training, the unit reviews the training materials to determine if SFPD has implemented any of the best practices presented at the training. SFPD provided an extensive list of best practices that they gleaned from various trainings and how SFPD had already implemented those practices and/or improved them since the trainings. As one example, SFPD learned from a training that agencies should not include the same information across all social media platforms. After learning of

this best practice, the Recruitment Unit adjusted their social media advertising.

Finally, SFPD has external support from DHR. SFPD notes that DHR has timely approved requests for resources (such as canopies and folding tables for recruitment events) and DHR participates in a hiring committee with SFPD, as described above.

To ensure that its recruitment activities are geared towards improving diversity and cultural and linguistic responsiveness, SFPD has ensured that its full-time recruiters are diverse, both in terms of gender and race. Out of its eight full-time recruiters, half are women and seven are people of color. Additionally, three speak other languages in addition to English (specifically, Cantonese, Portuguese, Spanish, Tagalog, Hawaiian, Tongan, and Samoan). Of SFPD's 90 part-time recruiters, 85% are people of color, 42% are women, and 38% speak other languages in addition to English. The Recruitment Unit also recruits at a wide range of events to ensure a diverse group of candidates. These events include SF's Black History Celebration as well as the Chinese New Year, Pride, and Adobo Festivals.

SFPD has analyzed data on its recruiting efforts and determined that in 2019 and 2020, about 45% of its recruiting events were focused on diversity recruitment.

SFPD has seen its recruiting efforts pay off. From 2007-2014, the SFPD hired an average of 44% of its racially diverse (i.e. non-White) recruits. From 2015-2019, the SFPD hired an average of 68% of its racially diverse recruits.

Based on all of the above, the California Department of Justice finds SFPD in substantial compliance with this recommendation.

Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss this further.

Tanya

Tanya S. Koshy (she/her)
Deputy Attorney General
Civil Rights Enforcement Section
California Department of Justice
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2100
Oakland, CA 94612

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This communication with its contents may contain confidential and/or legally privileged information. It is solely for the use of the intended recipient(s). Unauthorized interception, review, use or disclosure is prohibited and may violate applicable laws including the Electronic Communications Privacy Act. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and destroy all copies of the communication.

Finding # 85	The SFPD’s Recruitment Unit has implemented an active recruitment program focused on diversity and targeted recruiting throughout San Francisco but does not measure or validate the effectiveness of their outreach and events.
Recommendation # 85.1	The SFPD should continue supporting and overseeing this initiative and ensure the Recruitment Unit continues to implement best practices for recruitment, training, and outreach to improve diversity and cultural and linguistic responsiveness of the SFPD.

Recommendation Status	Complete	Partially Complete	In Progress
	Not Started	No Assessment	

Summary

For compliance measure one, SFPD identifies the traditional chain of command as the primary oversight mechanism. Recruitment is very much partnered with the City’s DHR to address oversight and legality. The SFPD/DHR Hiring Committee Meeting also creates a forum for oversight of recruitment activities and meets quarterly to review the hiring process and hiring data. It also supplies evidence of annual review being required under a Unit Order.

For compliance measure two, SFPD identifies requirements under Unit Order 17-07, that support review of best practices. SFPD sends two people annually for training, however this was limited in 2020 due to the pandemic and currently in 2021 due to budgetary issues. The department demonstrates actions taken in support of advancing best practices post-attendance at the conferences. However, it would benefit the SFPD to conduct this review of practices of major cities, ideally maintaining contact with those agencies that consistently demonstrate progressive practices. This will allow ongoing success during times of restricted travel – regardless of cause. The department also engaged external review, notably through a graduate student who did analysis of the department’s practices.

For compliance measure three, SFPD identifies the internal analysis and includes the Diversity Strategic Plan – Application Process Mapping. However, it relies upon data that identifies the progression of diversity within the recruiting practices of the SFPD. It identifies a diverse recruiting team. It has data on events and the diverse communities targeted at these events. It then provides data on the diversity of the applicant pool as a result of the recruiting activities. As the diversity strategic plan moves forward, direct mapping to the goals will be expected, but the data overall shows a focus on appropriate diversity and the outcome is an increasingly diverse applicant pool between 2007 and 2019.

For compliance measure four, the SFPD uses a tracking sheet to determine the progression of candidates through the hiring process, which can take up to 12 months or more. As of February 2020, the SFPD is now provided with applicant information from City’s Department of Human Resources (DHR) to facilitate tracking of progression. Another measure is the use of the event summary by which the Recruiting Unit (RU) identifies the events attended. The RU does use surveys such as “how did you hear about us” to help identify how applicants come to the department. The use of surveys includes contacts, applicants and candidates so it seems to be a way to gather information and is intended to link event activity to application. The openness to feedback is the primary route for effectiveness which is centered on outreach. While these measures identify the activities, and the subsequent assessment of efficacy, the department should consider linking applicants to activities and events and to what degree the RU presence at the events or outreach efforts contributed to the application and to those candidates that are successful. In 2019, two-thirds of the applicants had contact with RU members, a sign of strong engagement. The survey question about how to improve recruitment engagement should be used to develop future strategy.

Hillard Heintze File Review Recommendation # 85.1

Compliance Measures		Status/Measure Met
1	Evidence of continued oversight and support of recruitment activities.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
2	Ongoing review of best practices for recruitment, training and outreach, and continuous improvement loop established.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
3	Evidence that recruitment activities support diversity, cultural and linguistic goals.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
4	Establish measures for determining effectiveness of recruitment activities.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A

Administrative Issues

Please ensure the removal of any PII from the attachments before posting on the SFPD website.

Compliance Issues



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding #85: The SFPD's Recruitment Unit has implemented an active recruitment program focused on diversity and targeted recruiting throughout San Francisco but does not measure or validate the effectiveness of their outreach and events.

Recommendation # 85.1: The SFPD should continue supporting and overseeing this initiative and ensure the Recruitment Unit continues to implement best practices for recruitment, training, and outreach to improve diversity and cultural and linguistic responsiveness of the SFPD.

Response Date: 03/11/2021

Executive Summary:

The SFPD maintains oversight for all recruitment activities through an internal and external chain of command request process. Quarterly meetings also provide a forum for oversight of recruitment activities. The SFPD's Recruitment Unit efforts are supported by a negotiated budget, effective personnel in the approval process, and a strong partnership with DHR. The Recruitment Unit's Year End Review provides evidence of oversight and support for recruitment activities.

The SFPD reviews best practices for recruitment, training, and outreach on an ongoing basis by attending trainings and compiling a resource library. The SFPD has initiated two extensive reviews of its hiring process in the past few years and is now working with the Office of Racial Equity to draft a Racial Equity Action Plan. The SFPD also works closely with the DHR's Diversity Equity and Inclusion Recruitment Team.

Evidence that SFPD recruitment activities support diversity, cultural and linguistic goals is found in each step of the hiring process. Diverse members are selected for the recruitment unit, diverse recruitment events are selected, which leads to diverse applicants, which leads to diverse candidates progressing through the hiring process, which leads to diverse Academy recruits, which leads to a diverse police force. Bi-lingual pay is one example of a tool the Recruitment Unit uses to attract diverse candidates. The Recruitment Unit partners with other city agencies and community groups to obtain support for diversity hiring efforts.

The RU measures the effectiveness of recruiting activities, by utilizing a Tracking Sheet to track candidates through the hiring process, completing Event Summaries, collecting numerous surveys and completing a Year End Review Report. The future plan for improvement is to utilize a Text Messaging Platform and hire a Marketing Company.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Compliance Measures

1. Evidence of continued oversight and support of recruitment activities.

Oversight

Oversight for recruitment activities is found in the chain of command approval processes. Recruiters individually or as a team, research recruitment activities, advertising opportunities, new recruiting equipment and give away items. A memo is written to request permission. The memo travels up the chain of command for approval. The chain of command includes: Recruiter, Recruitment Sergeant, Staff Services Lieutenant, Staff Services Captain, Administration Bureau Commander, Administration Bureau Deputy Chief, Chief of Police. Different types of requests require different levels of approval. If a memo request involves a fee or payment it is sent to an additional oversight approval process. That additional approval involves the Fiscal Division, the City Controller's Office and DHR. Having this many points of approval creates an expansive oversight program. Any person involved in the approval process has the power to approve it, modify it, or deny the request.

The SFPD/DHR Hiring Committee Meeting also creates a forum for oversight of recruitment activities. The committee meets quarterly to review the hiring process and review current hiring data. The following units are included: The Recruitment Unit, the Background Investigation Unit, the Staff Services Division, the Basic Academy, the Field Training Program and the DHR Public Safety Team. Each unit gives an update of their current practices, future plans and provides any data or reports. The RU often reports to the committee which events it is currently participating and future recruitment activities. The RU presents any surveys that were collected since the previous meeting. The committee reviews everything presented and provides further guidance, suggestions, measures for accountability, and schedules future oversight reviews when needed. Unit Order 17-05 describes the committee, outlines the participants, and sets the frequency of meetings.

See **Attachment #1** Unit Order 17-05

The RU creates a Year End Review annually. The Year End Review is a great example of the RU's oversight. This review contains information about the RU members, the events, and activities the RU participated in, the completed advertising campaigns, etc. All event planning, personnel deployed for recruitment activities, travel plans, equipment deployed for recruitment activities, the purchased of new equipment, advertising campaigns and purchase of giveaway items had to go through the oversight approval process described above. The sheer volume of what is accomplished each year is evidence that an oversight process is established and effective.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

On Thursday, 02/25/2021, SFPD Professional Standards members participated in a conference call with members of Hillard Heintze and the California Department of Justice. During the prescreen call, suggestions and guidelines were discussed for this recommendation as described below.

"This package was generally good. Cal DOJ asked that SFPD submit the package once the 2020 year end review is completed so that the documentation demonstrating SFPD's implementation of this recommendation is current."

See the attached 2019 and 2020 Year End Reviews for complete reports of the RU activities. Unit Order 20-02 establishes the purpose and procedures related to the Year End Review and it describes the reporting plan.

See **Attachment #2** 2019 Year End Review
See **Attachment #27** 2020 Year End Review
See **Attachment #3** Unit Order 20-02

Support

The San Francisco Police Officers Association negotiated a recruitment budget. The details are contained in the current Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) contract which is valid until 6/30/23. Here is the language directly from the MOU:

"The Police Department will receive an annual allocation of \$250,000 to fund committee activities, programs and expenses. These funds may be used to develop enhanced recruitment and marketing programs, applicant preparation activities, and innovative new recruitment and hiring strategies."

This budget supports the SFPD's recruitment activities. The RU submits requests to use the funds for recruitment related activities. When internal approval is granted, DHR gives a secondary level of approval. DHR reviews the request, confirms it is recruitment related and then approves the expense.

See **Attachment #4** SFPD MOU (page 20)

Beyond the budget, the RU submits requests for other types of support. Some examples are the detailing of additional recruitment personnel to participate in recruitment events, the detailing of equipment for display at recruitment events (a SFPD vehicle, the SFPD quadski, the SFPD jet skis, a SFPD boat, tactical equipment, etc.). The requests for additional support personnel and equipment, also goes through the chain of command for approval and oversight. The RU's chain of command is very involved and supportive of the SFPD



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

recruitment efforts. Members in this chain of command more often approve or modify the requests. It is rare for a request to be completely denied.

DHR is also very supportive in the approval process. When DHR receives a request to approve a recruitment related payment, they usually approve the request in a timely manner. Examples of DHR approval requests: the fees for a job fair, an advertising campaign, equipment (canopies, folding tables, folding chairs, equipment containers), recruitment flyers, recruitment give away items, etc.

DHR's attendance and participation in the SFPD/DHR Hiring Committee Meetings also provides a great deal of support to the RU. DHR actively engages in open communication, provides suggestions for new recruitment activities, assists in identifying areas for improvement and participates in implementing suggestions for improvement.

The Year End Review is not just a great example of the oversight, but it is a great example of the RU's support. What the RU accomplishes each year is substantial evidence of the support the RU is provided. See the attached 2019 and 2020 Year End Reviews for complete reports of the RU activities.

See Attachment #2 2019 Year End Review

See Attachment #27 2020 Year End Review

2. Ongoing review of best practices for recruitment, training and outreach, and continuous improvement loop established.

To ensure the RU consistently reviews best practices for recruitment, training and outreach, Unit Order 17-07 was approved in 2017. This Unit Order states the RU shall annually send a minimum of two RU members to training related to police recruitment. After attending the training, the member documents their training and presents it to the other RU members. The training document is saved in the SFPD Staff Services-Recruitment Unit shared desktop folder.

These are the trainings that have been attended: 1st Annual Police Recruitment and Retention Summit May 22-23, 2017, 2nd Annual Police Recruitment and Retention Summit December 4-5, 2017, International Association of Women in Policing 2018 Conference August 26-30, 2018, Officer Recruitment and Retention November 27-28, 2018, Training at Twitter Headquarters December 18th 2018, Insight Exchange Network April 29th -30th 2019. Attachments 6-11 are the training documents which were presented to the RU and are stored in the SFPD Staff Services-Recruitment Unit shared desktop folder.

[REDACTED]