Recommendation 81.2

TK

Tanya Koshy ████████████████████
Wed 3/10/2021 5:02 PM

████████████████████████████████████
████████████████████████████████████
████████████████████████████████████
████████████████████████████████████

To:

- McGuire, Catherine (POL);
- Scott, William (POL);
- ████████████████████████

+8 others

> This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer:

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 81.2 that have been submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 81.2: The SFPD should publish annual statistics on the demographics of applicants for each stage of the hiring process.

Response to Recommendation 81.2:

SFPD publishes on its website annual statistics on the demographics (race and gender) of its applicants. SFPD publishes demographics of applicants at each stage of the hiring process, including the application submission phase, the written test, the physical ability test (PAT), the oral interview, the backgrounds investigation phase, and the candidates who enter the Police Academy (that is, candidates who pass the background investigation phase).

The City of San Francisco's Department of Human Resources (DHR) provides SFPD data for the stages of the hiring process that it oversees (application submission phase, the written test, the PAT, the oral interview) and SFPD maintains data on the remaining phases and on the Police Academy. The SFPD's Staffing and Deployment Unit uploads the data it receives from DHR or internally into a dashboard, which allows it to prepare graphs showing the demographics at each stage of the hiring process.

In addition to preparing and publishing graphs showing the annual statistics on the demographics (race and gender) of its applicants at each phase of the hiring process, SFPD also holds quarterly meetings with members of the Staff Services Division (the Recruitment Unit, the Backgrounds Unit, and the Staffing and Deployment Unit), the Training Division (the Academy), and DHR. The parties discuss the demographic data and identify ways to address any disparities observed in the data.

Based upon all of the above, the Department of Justice finds that SFPD is in substantial compliance with this recommendation. While SFPD has substantially complied with this

recommendation, the California Department of Justice recommends that SFPD also publish race and gender demographics at each stage of the hiring process as a percentage of the total number of applicants at each stage. For example, SFPD provides the passage rate for the PAT and the oral interview for each race and gender. In addition to these statistics, the California Department of Justice recommends that SFPD provide the percentage of the total number of applicants who passed the PAT and oral interview phases that are of each race and gender. SFPD already does this for the statistics on the background investigation phase. This will help the Department and the public track where in the hiring process any particular race, identity, or gender faces challenges in passing.

Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss this further. Thank you.

Tanya

Tanya S. Koshy
Deputy Attorney General
Civil Rights Enforcement Section
California Department of Justice
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2100
Oakland, CA 94612

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding # 81: **Despite a relatively good record in hiring diverse candidates, perception remains in the community that the SFPD seeks to eliminate diverse candidates from its hiring pool.** A lack of community engagement perpetuates this perception over hiring requirements.

Recommendation # 81.2: The SFPD should publish annual statistics on the demographics of applicants for each stage of the hiring process.

Response Date: 1/18/2021

Executive Summary:

The San Francisco Police Department has made efforts to recruit and hire diverse candidates. However, according to the DOJ Collaborative Reform report, community perception of SFPD remains uncertain as to SFPD's recruiting and hiring of diverse candidates. Publishing statistics of the demographics of applicants at various stages in the application process will increase transparency in the hiring process and better public perception and knowledge of SFPD hiring practices. It also helps further solidify SFPD's commitment to ensuring diversity in hiring by highlighting demographics that may need more recruitment or resources, and bringing any disparities, in both the application process more generally and amongst demographic groups, to the attention of the City's Department of Human Resources (DHR) and SFPD, who share joint responsibility for the overall process.

Annual statistics related to the phases of the hiring process are now available on the San Francisco Police Department's website (see https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/2021-01/DOJStatisticd.20210114.pdf and Screen Capture of SFPD Website, Attachment 1) and will continue to be updated after each calendar year draws to close.

Additionally, the Department has institutionalized a quarterly hiring meeting where SFPD and DHR come together to discuss demographic data and create plans to resolve any identified disparities (see Recruitment and Hiring Committee Quarterly Meeting Minutes, Attachment 2 and March 2019 Hiring Summary, Attachment 3).

Compliance Measures:

1) **Establish data collection plan for demographics.**
   The data needed for demographic analysis of each stage of the hiring process is as follows:

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Data Collector: DHR

- Total Applicants by Race and Gender (==Attachment 4==)
- Written Test Qualification, Attendance, and Passage Rate by Race and Gender (==Attachment 5==)
- Physical Ability Test Passage Rate by Race and Gender (==Attachment 6==)
- Oral Interview Passage Rate by Race and Gender (==Attachment 7==)

Data Collector: SFPD

- Candidates Entering the Backgrounds Process by Race and Gender (==Attachment 8==)

Data Collector: SFPD

- Recruits Entering the San Francisco Police Academy by Race and Gender (==Attachment 9==)

The data collection plan is already underway and is being spearheaded by SFPD's Staffing and Deployment Unit. The Staffing and Deployment Unit was established in April of 2018 under the Staff Services Division of SFPD's Administration Bureau (see Department Bulletin 18-073 – Staffing and Deployment Unit, ==Attachment 10== and PowerPoint: Overview of the Staffing and Deployment Unit (presented to newly promoted Lieutenants and Captains on 11-7-18), ==Attachment 11==). The Staffing and Deployment Unit is a centralized and impartial unit that collects, maintains and analyzes personnel data and serves as a repository for such data. These responsibilities extend not only to analysis of data as it relates to current Department members, but also candidates that seek to become members of the San Francisco Police Department. Thus the Staffing and Deployment Unit is collecting and analyzing all demographic data as it relates to the SFPD sworn hiring process.

Initial Hiring and Testing Data

The data collection plan includes SFPD receiving data quarterly from DHR in an Excel Spreadsheet format (see DHR Stats to SFPD – 6/7/19: Summary of the Q-2 Police Officer Selection Process Total Applicants, Summary of the Q-2 Police Officer Selection Process Written Test, Q-2: Written Test No Show Rate, Summary of the Q-2 Police Officer Selection Process Physical Ability Test, Q-2: PAT Pass/Fail Rate, Summary of the Q-2 Police Officer Selection Process Oral Interview, ==Attachment 12==). It is the responsibility of DHR to provide this data because they are responsible for coordinating and administering the initial phases of the hiring process which include the initial online

application process, the written test, the physical ability test, and the oral interview process, as well as the compilation of subsequent results.

It is SFPD's responsibility to analyze the data provided by DHR. Each quarter when SFPD receives the demographic data related to each test, the information is loaded into the data visualization software, Tableau, by the Staffing and Deployment Unit. The Staffing and Deployment Unit uses the data to create a series of interactive dashboards that allow SFPD to monitor demographics at multiple phases of the hiring process on an ongoing, internal basis. These dynamic dashboards are presented at the Quarterly Recruitment and Hiring Meetings and serve as a basis for discussion. Additionally, this allows the Staffing and Deployment Unit to generate annual demographic statistics for these phases of the hiring process which are now published on SFPD's website for external review (see https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/2021-01/DOJStatisticd.20210114.pdf and Screen Captures of SFPD Website – DHR Administered Testing Phases Demographic Data, Attachment 13).

Background Investigations Data

In addition to the aforementioned testing phases where data is collected from DHR, data is also collected internally from SFPD's Backgrounds Unit. SFPD is responsible for administering the backgrounds investigation process which is the next phase of the hiring process after DHR completes its testing. The Backgrounds Unit maintains a spreadsheet containing extensive candidate information that includes demographic data (this spreadsheet has not been included as an attachment due to the sensitivity and confidentiality of some of the information housed within). When the spreadsheet is updated by the Backgrounds Unit (which is done regularly as soon as new information is obtained), it automatically updates interactive Tableau dashboards created and maintained by the Staffing and Deployment Unit. The dashboard data denotes the demographic composition of all candidates entering the backgrounds process and is interactively visualized for internal analytical purposes and ongoing review. Annual demographic statistics for candidates entering the background investigation process are also published on the SFPD website (see https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/2021-01/DOJStatisticd.20210114.pdf and Screen Capture of SFPD Website – Backgrounds Demographic Data, Attachment 14).

Police Academy Data

The Staffing and Deployment Unit also works with SFPD's Police Academy to collect demographics for all candidates who have successfully passed the backgrounds investigation process and were ultimately hired to be recruits in the San Francisco

Police Academy, the final stage of the hiring process. This data is collected on an ongoing basis by the Staffing and Deployment Unit, as the data is linked to interactive Tableau dashboards that are monitored regularly internally. Annual demographic statistics for candidates who have successfully passed all stages of the hiring process and were selected to become recruits in the SFPD Police Academy are published on the SFPD website as well (see https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/2021-01/DOJStatisticd.20210114.pdf and Screen Capture of SFPD Website – Recruits Entering the Academy Demographic Data, Attachment 15).

Full Data Collection Plan

The aforementioned data collection plan is already in use and will continue to be used in the future. DHR has now submitted multiple cycles of data to SFPD and is committed to doing so on an ongoing, quarterly basis. Furthermore, this data is reviewed collaboratively in quarterly recruitment and hiring committee meetings (discussed in further detail below), evidencing the commitment and accountability to this plan and the roles and responsibilities of both SFPD and DHR (see Recruitment and Hiring Committee Quarterly Meeting Minutes, Attachment 2 and March 2019 Hiring Summary, Attachment 3). The Staffing and Deployment Unit utilizes the DHR data, along with SFPD's own, internally-generated, demographic statistics related to candidates entering the Backgrounds process and candidates ultimately becoming recruits in the SFPD Police Academy, to create a comprehensive picture of the demographics for each stage of the hiring process as well as the hiring process overall.

2) **Collect for each hiring process stage.**
As mentioned previously, the Staffing and Deployment Unit coordinates the collection of data for each stage of the initial hiring process from DHR (see DHR Stats to SFPD – 6/7/19: Summary of the Q-2 Police Officer Selection Process Total Applicants, Summary of the Q-2 Police Officer Selection Process Written Test, Q-2: Written Test No Show Rate, Summary of the Q-2 Police Officer Selection Process Physical Ability Test, Q-2: PAT Pass/Fail Rate, Summary of the Q-2 Police Officer Selection Process Oral Interview, Attachment 12).

The data is received quarterly and is immediately loaded into Tableau which then, in turn, updates the interactive dashboards (see Total Applicants by Race and Gender, Attachment 4; Written Test Qualification, Attendance, and Passage Rate by Race and Gender, Attachment 5; Physical Ability Test Passage Rate by Race and Gender, Attachment 6; and Oral Interview Passage Rate by Race and Gender, Attachment 7). Currently, hiring data has been collected for the years of 2013 through present. This data is analyzed by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and the associated dashboards are available for Command Staff review. Annual demographic statistics are also

published on SFPD's website which allows for external, public review (see https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/2021-01/DOJStatisticd.20210114.pdf and Screen Capture of SFPD Website, Attachment 1).

In addition to the data collected from DHR, the Department collects its own data internally as it relates to the backgrounds process (as outlined above). To reiterate, the Staffing and Deployment Unit obtains demographic data for all candidates entering the backgrounds investigation process from the Backgrounds Unit via a spreadsheet they maintain regularly that automatically uploads into Tableau and updates the associated dashboards (see Candidates Entering the Backgrounds Process by Race and Gender, Attachment 8). Currently, backgrounds data is available for the years 2018 through present and is available for Command Staff review. Annual demographic statistics for candidates entering the background investigation process are also published on the SFPD website for external review (see https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/2021-01/DOJStatisticd.20210114.pdf and Screen Capture of SFPD Website – Backgrounds Demographic Data, Attachment 14).

In a similar vein, the Department also collects its own data internally as it relates to candidates successfully completing all phases of the hiring process and becoming recruits at the San Francisco Police Academy. As stated previously, the Staffing and Deployment Unit obtains demographics statistics for recruits entering the Academy from SFPD's Police Academy (see Recruits Entering the Academy by Race and Gender, Attachment 9). This data is loaded into Tableau and used to create interactive dashboards that are monitored regularly internally. Currently, demographic data is available for recruits entering the Academy for years 2007 through present. Annual demographic statistics for candidates who have successfully passed all stages of the hiring process and were selected to become recruits in the SFPD Police Academy are published on the SFPD website for external review as well (see https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/2021-01/DOJStatisticd.20210114.pdf and Screen Capture of SFPD Website – Recruits Entering the Academy Demographic Data, Attachment 15).

3) **Internally and externally publish statistics annually.**
The Staffing and Deployment Unit has created a series of interactive dashboards in Tableau that speak to the demographics of each phase of the SFPD hiring process and are available for ongoing internal review. Once again, it should be noted that DHR is responsible for providing the initial hiring and testing data to SFPD for analysis and visualization; for Background Investigations and recruits hired to the Police Academy, SFPD collects, maintains, and visualizes the data internally.

Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Annual statistics gleaned from the information contained in these dashboards is also now published on the San Francisco Police Department website (see https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/2021-01/DOJStatisticd.20210114.pdf and Screen Capture of SFPD Website, Attachment 1) and provide a platform for both internal and external review. These demographic hiring statistics will be updated annually by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and published on SFPD's website at the beginning of each calendar year with final statistics for the year that has just concluded. This process is memorialized in an approved memorandum signed by the Deputy Chief of the Administration Bureau (see Approved Memorandum Outlining Demographic Hiring Statistics Publication Process, Attachment 16).

In addition to the annual publication of statistics, a quarterly hiring meeting is also held with members of the Administration Bureau, including the Staff Services Division (Recruitment Unit, Backgrounds Unit, and the Staffing and Deployment Unit) and the Training Division (Academy), as well as the City's overarching Department of Human Resources. In this meeting, demographic data as it pertains to the hiring and training process is discussed and strategies developed to address any identified demographic disparities (see Recruitment and Hiring Committee Quarterly Meeting Minutes, Attachment 2). This meeting allows for ongoing and continuous improvement related to demographic patterns in all phases of the sworn hiring process.

PSPPB Form 2001 v2